1 (Pages 1 to 4)

```
1
                      UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
                                                                1 APPEARANCES:
                      SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA
                                                                  DANIEL BARROUKH, ESO.
                      MIAMI DIVISION
                                                                3 Derek Smith Law Group, PLLC
                      CASE NO: 1:22-CV-21004-DPG
                                                                  520 Brickell Key Drive
                                                                4 Suite 0-301
   JESSICA GUASTO,
                                                                  Miami, Florida 33131-2433
            Plaintiff,
                                                                5 Office: 786-688-2335
E-mail: Danielb@dereksmithlaw.com
  THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH FLORIDA,
                                                                            COUNSEL APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF.
  a Florida municipality,
                                                                  MICHAEL ELKINS, ESQ.
                                                                8 MLE Law
            Defendant.
                                                                  1212 Northeast 16th Terrace
                                                                9 Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33304-2323
                                                                  Office: 954-401-2608
   -----/
                                                               10 E-mail: Melkins@mlelawfirm.com
                                                                            COUNSEL APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANT.
                                                               11
  DEPOSITION OF:
                           PAUL M. MASON, PhD
                                                               12
                           APRIL 19, 2024
                                                               13
  TIME:
                           10:13 A.M. - 11:36 A.M.
                                                               14
                                                               15
                           VIA REMOTE CONFERENCING
  PLACE:
                                                               16
                                                               17
                                                               19
                                                               20
                                                               21
                                                               22
  REPORTED BY:
                           SUSAN BARNARD,
                                                               23
                           PROFESSIONAL COURT STENOGRAPHER
                                                               24
                                                               25
                           NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF FLORIDA
                                                         3
                                                                                                                        4
                        INDEX
                                                                    Thereupon,
                                                                 1
                                                                               PAUL M. MASON, PhD,
 3 WITNESS:
                                                                    having been first duly sworn remotely, was examined and
 4 Paul M. Mason, PhD
                                                                    testified as follows:
                                                                               DIRECT EXAMINATION
   DIRECT EXAMINATION
                                                                    BY MR. ELKINS:
 6 By Mr. Elkins
                                                                 7
                                                                          All right. Good morning, Mr. Mason.
                                                        53
                                                                 8
                                                                    A.
                                                                          Good morning.
   CROSS EXAMINATION
 8 By Mr. Barroukh
                                                                 9
                                                                    Q.
                                                                          Can you hear me okay?
                                                                10 A.
                                                                          Yes.
10
                                                                11 O.
                                                                          There is a little motion in the background.
                                                                    Someone in my office is making espresso, so that noise
11
                                                                13
                                                                    will go away very quickly.
                  INDEX TO EXHIBITS
12
                                                                14
                                                                    A.
                                                                         I can't hear it.
13 DEFENDANT'S
                                                                15
                                                                          Perfect. My name is Michael Elkins. I
14 Exhibit
                       Description
                                                       Page
1.5
                       case list
                                                         8
                                                                    represent the City of Miami Beach from the lawsuit of
16
                       updated report
                                                        25
                                                                17
                                                                    Jessica Guasto, also known as Jessica Salabarria.
17
                       FRS documents
                                                        38
                                                                18
                                                                         Are you familiar with the lawsuit?
18
                       03-26-2024 e-mail
                                                        48
                                                                19
                                                                   A.
                                                                          Yes.
19
                       estimates
                                                                20 Q.
                                                                          Are you familiar with the allegations in the
2.0
                                                                21 lawsuit?
21
                                                                          I don't know a whole lot about what transpired,
                                                                22 A.
22
                                                                23 but I know that she was dismissed.
23
                                                                          Did you read the Complaint in this lawsuit?
                                                                24 Q.
24
                                                                25 A.
                                                                          I never saw the Complaint.
25
```

5

(Pages 5 to 8)

Q. Have you read any of the papers filed in this

2 lawsuit?

1

3 A. I have documents related to Ms. Salabarria, but

I don't have any depositions or any court filings or 4

5 anything like that.

6 So just to be clear, you haven't read any

7 deposition transcripts. You have not read any court

8 filings in formulating your opinion in this case,

9 correct?

10 A. That is correct.

11 Q. Okay. Have you been deposed before?

12 Yes, probably somewhere between 500 and 1,000 A.

13 times.

20

14 Q. So not many.

15 Α. Well, I don't know, I guess relative to

attorneys; probably not relative to other expert 16

17 witnesses. It is probably a lot.

18 Part of me just wants to see can you go through

19 every one of the thousand depositions you have been in.

MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

21 Right. Obviously then, do you understand the

22 rules of a deposition? So I am not going to get into

the nitty-gritty rules that I would normally go over 23

with someone that hasn't been deposed. I will remind

you of the most important rule that we have.

1 There is a court reporter here. And as great as

she is, she just can't take down two people talking at

3 the same time. I am sure you have been told this as

many times as you have been in depos. So we need to follow this rule and make sure that we don't talk over

6 each other.

7 Do you understand that?

8 A. I do.

9 Q. Okay. And did you do anything to prepare for 10 this deposition?

Yes, I looked over the file again yesterday 11 A.

morning, and they were -- I had a brief call with Mr. 12

Barroukh yesterday afternoon. 13

14 MR. BARROUKH: I am going to interrupt and tell

15 Dr. Mason not to discuss anything on the phone call.

16 Thank you.

17 MR. ELKINS: Well, hold on. He can certainly

discuss anything that would be covered under Rule 26 as 18

exempt from the attorney-client privilege. 19

20 MR. BARROUKH: Absolutely. Absolutely.

21 Q. First of all, how long was your phone call?

22 A. About 15 minutes.

23 Q. Did you, during that phone call, did your

attorney or did the attorney give you any additional

facts or assumptions for you to use either in this

7

deposition in formulating your opinion? 1

2 A.

3 Okay. Okay. Perfect. Can you tell me your Q. educational background, please?

4 5

Yes, I have a Bachelor's degree in Math and

Economics from the University of Delaware. The first 6 7 two years were in Villanova. And I finished a year and

a half at Delaware, and then I got a Master's degree at

9 the University of Delaware in Economics. And then I got

10 a PhD in Economics at the University of Texas in Austin.

11 Got it. How many times have you been qualified

as an expert either in a court of law or in some other

proceeding like an administrative proceeding or 13

14 arbitration before any tribunal?

15 A. I would say around a thousand times.

Okay. I want to make sure I got this as to how 16 Q.

many times you have been qualified as an expert either

in a court of law or through some other tribunal. 18

19 Yeah, maybe it is somewhere between 500 and A.

20 1,000.

Q. 21 Okay.

22 A. I have been doing this since 1985.

23 I am certainly not trying to impugn or I am not Q.

24 saying that there is some problem here, but I am a

25 little concerned about something. So I am going to show

you what I will mark as Exhibit 1. 1 2

(Exhibit is marked for identification.)

3 This is the case list. Can you see this 0.

4 document, sir?

5 A. Correct, yes. I remember creating it.

6 This is the case list that lists all cases that

we asked for where you have been qualified as an expert.

And you have only listed one, two, three, four, five --

9 So where are the other 995?

10 A. This is only for the last three years.

Q. 11 Okay. So your testimony is in the last three

years, you have been qualified as an expert five times.

And then in all the years prior to that, there is 13

another 995 cases in which you actually have been 14

15 qualified as an expert?

16 I believe so, yes. I lived in Jacksonville,

Florida for 31 years. I began as an expert witness in

the Fall of 1985. Some years in the Nineties and the 18

19 2000's, I was doing 80 to 100 cases a year. When I came

20 to Abilene where I presently am, I became the Dean of

21 the Johnson School at the university. I cut back

considerably on my expert witness work in part because I 22

was further away and that made it more difficult for 23

them to use me and because my duties as dean took up too

much of my time.

Coastal Reporting, Inc. (954) 523-5326

9

3 (Pages 9 to 12)

1 Q. Give me just one minute, please.

2 A. Yup.

3 Q. Why did you only provide a list for the previous

4 three years?

5 A. Because that was what was requested.

6 Q. Are you familiar with the requirement of Federal

7 Rule of Civil Procedure 26 regarding disclosures?

8 A. Yes.

9 MR. BARROUKH: Objection. Calls for a legal

10 conclusion.

MR. ELKINS: I am not asking him to interpret.

12 I am asking if he is familiar with the rule. There is

13 no legal conclusion there.

14 You can answer, sir.

15 A. Yeah, ordinarily the request is for five years.

16 But the request I received was for three, so that's what

17 I provided.

21

2

MR. ELKINS: One second. Let's take a

19 two-minute break.

20 (Off the record.)

BY MR. ELKINS:

22 Q. All right. Sir, Federal Rule of Civil Procedure

23 26-A to B-5 concerns disclosures of an expert witness

4 irrespective of what a law asks for. In other words,

25 these disclosures are required at the time you file your

1 report. And it requires, excuse me, a list of all other

2 cases in which during the previous four years the

3 witness testified as an expert at trial or by

4 deposition.

5 So the list that you provided, is it for three

6 years or for four years?

7 A. It is for three.

8 Q. Okay. Are there other cases not listed from

9 that additional year that is missing?

10 A. Yes

11 Q. Okay. And are there additional items not on the

12 list for the three-year period such as when you

13 testified in deposition?

14 A. No.

15 Q. So at least for the three-year period, this is a

16 list of all cases in which you testified as an expert at

7 trial or by deposition; is that correct?

18 A. That is correct.

19 Q. Okay. And then there are cases that are missing

20 that you did not disclose for the one-year prior,

21 correct?

22 A. Correct.

23 Q. Why didn't you comply with the rule, seeing as

24 you have been an expert thousands of times as you told

25 me?

11 12

1 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

3 A. I complied with what I was requested to do. I

4 don't recall being requested to provide Rule 26

5 information.

6 Q. Well, you understand that you have been retained

7 as an expert in a lawsuit that is in Federal Court,

8 right?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You have done that before I presume, correct?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And I presume since you have done that, you are

13 familiar with your expert disclosure requirement,

14 correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. But in this case, you did not comply with them.

17 Correct?

18 A. Yeah, I believe it is because I missed noting

19 that it was in Federal Court.

20 Q. Okay. Where did you think this case was

21 pending?

22 A. Well, since I never received any document

23 stating so, other than the original letter that said

24 U.S. District Court, Southern District of Florida, I

25 just missed that that was Federal.

1 Q. What original letter are you referring to?

2 A. The letter I received on Friday, January the

3 19th, In Re: Retainer fee in this case. Whereby, Mr.

4 Daragiati provided me with your original retainer.

5 Q. Have you produced that letter in this case?

6 A. I tried to send it to Mr. Barroukh. I scanned

7 it in and sent it. But he said he never got it.

8 Q. Okay. Hold on a second. Let's just -- This is

9 not going to be as short as I originally intended. Let

10 me unpack this. It sounds like you are holding the

11 letter right there?

12 A. I am.

13 Q. Okay. Are you telling me that there is a letter

14 between you and the plaintiff's prior counsel, Paul

15 Daragjati, which discusses your engagement; and this

16 letter, as sitting here today in this deposition, has

17 not been produced? Is that accurate?

18 A. I recall Mr. Barroukh asking me to send it. I

19 recall sending it in an e-mail with an attachment, but

20 he didn't get it.

21 Q. Okay. But so my question is: Sitting here

22 today right now, that letter has not been produced; is

23 that not accurate?

24 A. I would say that is fair, yes.

25 Q. Okay. What other documents do you have

Coastal Reporting, Inc. (954) 523-5326

(Pages 13 to 16)

14

13

discussing your engagement, any assumptions or facts 2 provided to you that you haven't already produced in 3 this case?

Are there other documents?

5 MR. BARROUKH: Objection on the grounds of privilege with prior counsel. Mr. Daragiati is not 6 7 here. I don't know that Mr. Daragiati is involved 8 himself. I have already provided --

9 MR. ELKINS: Daniel, I didn't ask him for a broad-based disclosure. I asked him for a document, any 10 facts or data that were provided to him by the lawyer, 11 any documents relating to those things that is exempt under Rule 26 from privilege. 13

You can answer.

- 15 The only other thing I have is the letter that came with the check for subsequent work that I give 16
- after the deposition to actually excuse me after the 17
- initial letter to produce my report. 18
- Is that another letter from Mr. Daragjati? 19 Q.
- A. 20

4

14

6

9

10

11

12

13

14

- 21 And that letter came with a check for your О. 22 compensation?
- Correct. 23 A.
- 24 0. And you haven't produced that letter in this
- 25 case either, have you?

1 A. No, I wasn't requested to.

2 Q. Under Rule 26, you are required to produce all

3 documents and your initial disclosures relating to your 4 compensation.

- 5 A.
- 6 0. But why didn't you do that?
- 7 Because as I indicated before, I didn't note A.
- 8 that this was in Federal Court.
- 9 Okay. Are there any other documents relating to 10 your compensation or anything like that that you haven't produced, anything that we haven't covered yet? 11
- 12 A.
- 13 Q. Okay. Let's go back to your case list. First 14 of all, tell me the cases that are in missing from this list. And remember, you had to disclose depositions

16 and/or trial testimony.

17 MR. BARROUKH: Mike, I am going to object. Your 18 interrogatory asks for three years explicitly.

MR. ELKINS: It doesn't matter. The rule says 19

four. My interrogatory doesn't override the rule. And 20

to be clear, the rule required all of this at the time 21

he gave his report. So I can ask for three, one or two 22

but the federal rule requires four. 23

24 MR. BARROUKH: And I can provide you with four;

however, the interrogatory requested three.

15

16

1 MR. ELKINS: Daniel, you are confused. The rule required the disclosure at the time he produced the report. The interrogatories are for followup if stuff isn't produced, which none of it was. So you guys have 4 5 violated the rule on the initial disclosure which the rule already granted a Motion to Strike once. And then 7 when I followed up, you still didn't follow the rule. 8

So you can object, but he needs to answer this question. I am entitled to know under the rule four years. That's what the rule says. Does the rule say something different that I am not aware of?

MR. BARROUKH: I don't believe so. I am just letting you know under the interrogatory, we have provided what was requested specifically.

15 MR. ELKINS: I am not suggesting that there is a 16 problem with the interrogatory response. I have made it 17 very clear that the problem is with the initial 18 disclosure. Under the rule, this information was not -

was supposed to have been disclosed as part of the 20 original disclosure and it wasn't. So --

MR. BARROUKH: The initial disclosure was prior 21 counsel and we have since seeked to amend these 22 23 responses.

24 MR. ELKINS: Daniel, I don't care if it was prior counsel. You guys took the case. You took it with all the awards that come with it. The Judge

awarded an amended report, which was under your watch.

And it still wasn't disclosed properly.

MR. BARROUKH: Absolutely. If you have a problem with not wanting us to provide that fourth 6 additional year of deposition and trials, then I am not 7 sure --

8 MR. ELKINS: I want your expert to answer these 9 questions. You are instructing him not to answer. Are 10 you serious right now?

11 MR. BARROUKH: That's not what I am doing. I 12 don't think I have instructed him not to answer.

13 MR. ELKINS: Then I will continue my deposition 14 because this conversation right now is pointless.

15 BY MR. ELKINS:

Sir, please provide to me the missing cases for 16 that additional year that are not on this list. And 18 remember, you are required to provide trials and 19 depositions.

20 A. Okay. Well, let's define the year, first all.

Does that go back to April of 2020? All of 2020? I

have a list in front of me that goes back to 2016. 22

The rule says you have to provide: "A list of 23 О.

all other cases in which during the previous four years

25 the witness testified as an expert at trial or by

17

5 (Pages 17 to 20)

deposition." That's what the rule says.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. It says: "This disclosure must be accompanied

4 by the written report." So you were disclosed in, I

5 believe, late 2023. And then your amended report was

in, I think, January or February 2024. So I think we

7 can run the date back from, let's say, February 2024

8 backwards.

9 A. Okay. Then there is a case. It was a medical

10 malpractice case in February where I was deposed.

11 Q. February 2020?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. What is the style of the case?

14 A. I am sorry. Say it again.

15 Q. What is the style of the case?

16 A. It was a deposition in a medical malpractice

17 case. I can give you the case number, if you want.

18 Q. Give me the case number and the tribunal.

19 A. It is 2020, 17-CA-001347. The plaintiff's name

20 is Vahle, V-A-H-L-E.

MR. BARROUKH: Michael, I believe that is on the

22 list. It says trial, but I believe, to make it faster,

23 it is on the list. He also performed a deposition, if I

am understanding correctly.

MR. ELKINS: Hold on a second. Let him testify.

1 I don't see it on the list. I see a medical

2 malpractice.

3 A. It is May of 2022, V-A-H-L-E.

4 Q. You also testified in that case?

5 A. I did.

6 Q. Were you qualified as an expert?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Any other cases for the extra year that is

9 missing?

10 A. Yeah, there is a case in June of 2020. The

11 plaintiff's name was Rullo. It was a Title IX case.

12 Q. What is the spelling of the name of the

13 plaintiff, please?

14 A. R-U-L-L-O.

15 Q. What was the name of the defendant?

16 A. I don't report that information.

17 Q. You don't record the full name of the case in

18 which you are hired as an expert?

19 A. Only the person I represent or company I

20 represent and the attorney that I worked for.

21 Q. Who was the attorney?

22 A. H-E-N-R-I-C-H-S-O-N.

23 O. In which tribunal was this case?

24 A. Federal Court, Title IX.

25 Q. What Federal Court?

19 20

1 A. I don't report that information, just Federal.

2 Q. Let me make sure. In providing information on

the cases that you allege that you have previously been

4 qualified in as an expert or been deposed, you are

5 telling me that you don't keep track of the defendant

6 and you do not keep track of the specific court?

7 A. That's correct.

8 Q. So how then if I wan to research your history

9 would I look up this rule location?

10 How would I find it if you don't give me the

11 information to do so?

12 A. By the case number.

13 Q. What is the case number?

14 A. 2:17-CV-01380-MPK.

15 Q. And you understand that a Federal case number

16 doesn't really tell me which Federal Court it is in?

17 A. I didn't know that.

18 Q. Okay. Any other cases?

19 A. Yeah, there was the Davis case in August of

20 2020.

21 O. Okay. What was the case number for that?

22 A. 2013-CA-007673-0.

23 Q. I am assume you don't know the tribunal for this

24 case either?

25 A. It was circuit court in Florida.

1 Q. But you don't know what County?

2 A. I don't recall.

3 Q. Did you testify or were you deposed or both?

4 What happened?

5 A. I was deposed.

6 Q. What was this case about?

7 A. It was --

8 MR. BARROUKH: Objection. Calls for

9 speculation.

10 Q. Okay. What was the case about? You can answer.

11 A. It was a child that was purported to have been

12 harmed at birth when the doctor used forceps to deliver

13 the baby.

14 Q. Was it a Med/Mal case?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Okay. Any other cases that I am missing?

17 A. Yeah, there was one which was in March of 2021.

MR. BARROUKH: That is on the list.

19 Q. Anything that is not on the list that I am

20 missing?

18

21 A. The rest of the ones on my list, I don't know

22 any that --

23 Q. So no cases that are not on the list that I am

24 missing?

25 A. I believe that's it.

Coastal Reporting, Inc. (954) 523-5326

21

6 (Pages 21 to 24)

1 Q. Okay. All right. Thank you for that. Have you

2 ever been an expert in a case involving a municipality

- 3 or governmental entity?
- 4 A. I am sure I have been, but I don't recall any
- 5 details.
- 6 Q. Well, sitting here today, do you remember
- 7 specifically any case where there was a governmental
- 8 entity or municipality involved?
- 9 **Sir?**
- MR. BARROUKH: I am going to object to form.
- MR. ELKINS: You can answer, sir.
- 12 A. I don't recall off the top of my head.
- 13 Q. Sir, if you are not -- Sir, you are not allowed
- 14 to look at documents during the deposition to try to
- 15 answer my questions. So what I need you to do is put
- 16 the computer aside and answer my questions. I want to
- 17 note for the record when I asked this question, the
- 18 witness attempted to find his answer on his computer.
- 19 So sitting here today, do you recall any cases
- 20 that involve a municipality or government entity without
- 21 looking at your computer or whatever documents you have,
- 22 unless you want to produce those to me?
- 23 A. I don't recall.
- 24 Q. Okay. How about any cases involving public
- 25 sector pension plans prior to this case?

- 1 A. Yes, I have.
 - 2 Q. Okay. So you remember cases involving public
 - 3 sector pension plans?
 - 4 A. I am pretty confident that I have had cases
 - 5 involving municipalities too. I just can't remember the
 - 6 details. One of the things that throughout my career I
 - 7 believe has worked in my favor is that once a case is
 - 8 over, I forget about it; otherwise, they would all run
 - 9 together.
- 10 Q. Okay. So sitting here today then, what you are
- 11 telling me then is you are pretty sure you worked with
- 12 public sector pension plans and municipalities at some
- 13 point; but because of this, what you consider to be an
- 14 advantage that you forget about your cases, you just
- 15 can't give me any information on those sitting here at
- 16 your deposition today. Is that accurate?
- 17 A. That's accurate.
- 18 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 19 Q. And certainly within the last four years, you
- 20 have not worked on a case involving a municipality or a
- 21 public sector pension plan excluding this case?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- 23 Q. Okay. Have you ever in the last four years
- 24 worked on any cases or been an expert in any case
- 25 involving employment discrimination claims?

23

- 1 A. Yes. I am sorry, the last four years?
- 2 Q. Correct
- 3 A. There was -- Let's see. Can you ask me that
- 4 question again, please?
- 5 Q. In the last four years -- Well, let me do it
- 6 this way: On your list here that I have in front of
- you, it looks like the four cases that aren't this case
- 8 under type that says personal injury, personal injury,
- 9 medical malpractice and personal injury, correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. So certainly those four cases did not involve
- 12 employment discrimination, correct?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 Q. Okay. And then for the three cases that you
- 15 listed for me just now additionally, one was a med/mal
- 16 case, which is I think also on the list. Then there was
- 17 a Title IX case. And then the August 2020 case, the
- 18 Davis case, do you remember what that was about?
- 19 A. Yeah, that was a medical malpractice case.
- 20 Q. Okay. So we just talked about all the cases
- 21 that you've disclosed that you've been a part of in the
- 22 last four years and none of them were employment
- 23 discrimination cases, correct?
- 24 A. I believe that is correct. The Rullo case is
- 25 kind of confusing in that it was a case of a woman who

- 1 had an issue with another student in law school; and as
- 2 a result, she had to change law schools, and that
- 3 impacted on her employability. And that's why I'm
- 4 wavering because that case may be within the realm.
- 5 Q. Okay. But other than the Title IX case that you
- 6 just talked about, no other employment discrimination,
- o just talked about, no other employment discrimination correct?
- 8 A. Not in the last four years, no.
- 9 Q. How about prior to the last four years?
- 10 A. Yeah, I had a lot of them.
- 11 Q. Under Title VII?
- MR. BARROUKH: Objection. I am going to say it
- 13 calls for legal conclusion and speculation, if it is
- 14 Title VII.
- MR. ELKINS: If he knows, he can answer.
- 16 Q. Were you involved in a case that involved Title
- 17 VII?
- 18 A. I don't know what Title VII is, but I have had
- 19 cases where employment has been adversely affected. And
- 20 I testified at either deposition or trial or both in
- 21 those cases.
- 22 Q. So I am going to make sure I heard you
- 23 correctly. You said you don't know what Title VII is,
- 24 correct?
- 25 A. That's what I said.

Coastal Reporting, Inc. (954) 523-5326

22

7 (Pages 25 to 28)

26

28

25

- 1 Q. Okay. All right. Do you know what the Florida2 Civil Rights Act is?
- 3 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 4 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 5 A. I don't know the details, but I am aware of it.
- 6 Q. Okay. What are you aware of about it?
- 7 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 8 A. In the State of Florida, that people cannot be
- 9 discriminated against based on race, ethnicity, gender,
- 10 et cetera.
- MR. BARROUKH: We couldn't hear you.
- 12 MR. ELKINS: Sorry.
- 13 Q. Anything else?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Have you ever been involved or an expert in a
- 16 case involving the Florida Civil Rights Act?
- 17 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 18 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 19 A. I don't know.
- 20 Q. Okay. Okay. Let's talk a minute about your
- 21 report or your updated report, which I will mark as
- 22 **Exhibit 2.**
- 23 (Exhibit is marked for identification.)
- 24 Q. Can you see the screen?
- 25 A. I can.

- 1 Q. The case list will be Exhibit 1. The report is
- 2 Exhibit 2, your updated report.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Do you know why you were required to file an5 updated expert report?
 - MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 7 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 8 A. Well, I was asked to. But now that I recognize
- 9 that this is Federal Court, it should have been produced
- 10 anyway.

15

- 11 Q. Are you familiar with the Judge's order striking 12 your initial report?
- MR. BARROUKH: Objection. I am going to
- 14 instruct you not to talk about our conversation.
 - THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 16 Q. If you can answer the question without talking
- 17 about what you and your counsel talked about, then you
- 18 are free to answer it.
- So I will re-ask the question: Are you familiar
- 20 with the judge's order striking your initial expert
- 21 report?
- 22 A. Not independently of conversations with Mr.
- 23 Barroukh.
- 24 Q. Stop right there. We will leave it at that. So
- 25 I presume you are familiar with this report, correct?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Okay. I just want to go over a couple of things
- 3 in here. I don't want to spend too much time on it.
- 4 A. Okav
- 5 Q. Initially in the report, you say that: "This is
- 6 at the request of Daniel Barroukh" --
- 7 MR. ELKINS: Am I pronouncing your name 8 correctly?
- 9 MR. BARROUKH: It is Barroukh.
- 10 MR. ELKINS: Thank you.
- 11 Q. "At the request of Daniel Barroukh, I am
- 12 providing the written report with the spreadsheet
- 13 document in the case of Jessica Salabarria Guasto."
- Now just to reiterate, I want to make sure I
- 15 understand this. In producing this report, you do not
- $1\,6\,$ know what Ms. Salabarria's claims are against the City
- 17 of Miami Beach, correct?
- 18 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 20 A. All I know is that she was dismissed.
- 21 Q. Understood. And you didn't read the Complaint,
- 22 correct, in formulating your opinion?
- 23 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 24 A. No, it was never provided to me.
- 25 Q. Did you ask for it?

- 1 MR. BARROUKH: Objection. I will instruct you 2 not to answer.
- 3 MR. ELKINS: Well, if he wanted the Complaint as
- 4 part of forming his opinion, that is fair game.
- 5 MR. BARROUKH: You can ask if he was given the
- 6 Complaint or read the Complaint. But if he asked for
- 7 the Complaint, I don't think he should answer that
- 8 question.
- 9 MR. ELKINS: Okay. Fair enough.
- 10 Q. And you say here that the result was her
- 11 dismissal from Miami-Dade County Police Department.
- Do you see that?
- 13 A. Yup.
- 14 Q. Okay. And I presume the statements in your
- 15 report are accurate to the best of your knowledge,
- 16 correct?
- 17 A. Well, subsequent to the report, I note that the
- 18 W2's indicated different municipality.
- 19 Q. What municipality?
- 20 A. Miami Beach, although it wasn't even called that
- 21 in some of the documents.
- 22 Q. Okay. So are you aware which municipality Ms.
- 23 Salabarria worked for, sir? You can't Sir, you
- 24 cannot -- Sir --
- I want the record to reflect that the witness is

29

8 (Pages 29 to 32)

again looking at documents when he has been instructed

2 not to do that, and I have no idea what these documents

3 **are.**

4 So without looking at your document, sir, as you

5 have been previously instructed not to look at the

documents, but looking at what I provided and marked as

7 Exhibit 2, which is your report, sitting here today, are

8 you aware what municipality Ms. Salabarria worked for?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And what municipality is that?

11 A. Miami Beach Police Department.

12 Q. Is the Miami Beach Police Department a

13 municipality?

14 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

15 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

16 A. No, that was the employer. The municipality is

17 Miami-Dade, I believe.

18 Q. Okay. In your report you talk about the Florida

19 DROP Program. You see where I highlighted it? Do you

20 see that on the document?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Are you referring to the Florida DROP Program

23 that is associated with the Florida Retirement System?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Okay. What is your understanding of the Florida

1 Retirement System?

2 A. If you enter the Florida Retirement System, not

3 the optional plan, you are eligible for DROP in the last

4 eight years of employment. It used to be less than

5 that. And what it does is increase your income, but you

6 continue to get your retirement which is held in an

7 account that pays interest, and you receive it when you

8 actually retire.

9 Q. Do you know what the acronym DROP stands for?

10 A. I know I have seen it recently, but I forgot.

11 Q. Okay. How many cases besides this one have you

12 been retained in that involve DROP programs?

13 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

14 A. I would say 10 to 15.

15 Q. Okay. Do you remember the names of those?

16 A. No.

17 Q. And what is your understanding of what a DROP

18 program is?

19 A. I was still in Florida when the DROP program was

20 created. It was a way to bolster the retirement of

21 state employees but at the same time motivate those

22 employees to retire earlier than they might otherwise.

23 Q. And by entering the DROP program, there are

24 certain calculations that essentially give the employee

25 retiring earlier than they would otherwise bumps to

31 32

1 their pension, significant bumps. So they get basically

a benefit, a significant benefit, financially for

3 retiring early. Is that a fair statement of a DROP

4 program?

5 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

6 A. That's my --

MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

8 A. That's my understanding, yes.

9 Q. And then different DROP programs, correct me if

10 I am wrong, have different calculations, correct?

11 A. Yes

7

12 Q. So like Florida is the Florida Retirement System

13 DROP program, by way of example, would be different than

4 if a particular city or let's say another state than say

15 the state of Tennessee's DROP program, correct?

16 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

17 MR' ELKINS: Hypothetically.

18 MR. BARROUKH: Incomplete hypothetical.

MR. ELKINS: That's fine. You can answer.

20 A. I don't know that I have done any cases

21 involving DROP outside the State of Florida.

22 Q. Okay. Well then within the State of Florida, if

a municipality, for example, had its own DROP program

24 outside the Florida Retirement System, that would be

5 based on a different calculation than how the Florida

1 Retirement System does it, correct?

2 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

3 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

4 A. I really don't know the answer to that.

5 Q. Okay. That's fair. That's fair. And you were

6 using the Florida Retirement System DROP program and the

7 calculations that went with that DROP program, correct?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Okay. Perfect. You see number nine where it

10 says various data sources?

11 A. Yes.

12 **O.** What are the various data sources?

13 A. I have a document that I have created over the

14 years and added to each year that looks at interest

15 rates, inflation rates, growth rates of earnings and

16 other things like that that help me determine the gross

17 growth rates used in certain cases. I indicated to Mr.

18 Barroukh that --

MR. BARROUKH: Objection on this. Yeah, I am

20 going to instruct you not to talk about our discussions

21 and please focus on answering the question if possible.

22 Michael, I am also going to object on privilege

23 and instruct the client not to answer this question.

MR. ELKINS: Wait a minute. Wait a minute.

25 Hold on. I asked --

Coastal Reporting, Inc. (954) 523-5326

33

9 (Pages 33 to 36)

MR. BARROUKH: Could you repeat the question, please, actually?

3 MR. ELKINS: Yeah, he wasn't done answering. I

- 4 mean, I don't want him to reveal privileged
- 5 communication, but he has put in his report that he
- relied on. In fact, it says: "The following represents
- 7 all the materials I considered in developing my opinions
- 8 in the above referenced case."
- 9 In number nine, he says various data sources.
- 10 So there is no privilege relating to those various data
- 11 sources. I am entitled. And he has to tell me what
- 12 they are. And if he talked about those various data
- 13 sources with you, that's not privileged.
- 14 MR. BARROUKH: I understand.
- MR. ELKINS: Okay. So continue, sir, with your
- 16 answer. You were telling me about this document you
- 17 created.
- 18 A. Yes. But I determined after I submitted the
- 19 report that given the nature of this case and the facts
- 20 that I used in this case, that I didn't really use that
- 21 document
- 22 Q. You mean you determined that after you submitted
- 23 your amended report? You independently then decided,
- 4 oh, wait a minute, I didn't really use that document?
- 25 A. I did.

- 1 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 2 MR. ELKINS: That's fine.
- 3 Q. But you didn't amend the report to reflect that, 4 did you?
- 5 A. I did not.
- 6 Q. And when you say you didn't really use it, does
- 7 that mean you didn't use it at all, or you only used it
- 8 a little bit?
- 9 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 10 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 11 A. To the extent I identified earnings based on the
- 12 average growth rates of earnings for hourly workers in
- 13 my pretermination potential salary earnings column, I
- 14 used it; but otherwise not, because my discount rate and
- 15 my growth rates in the future were not predicated on
- 16 that document.
- 17 Q. But you did use it? I think you just told me
- 18 you used it in this report.
- 19 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 21 A. I used one or two numbers from that report for
- 22 the growth rates of earnings in 2020, 2021, but that was
- 23 it.
- 24 Q. So why didn't you produce these various, this
- 25 document, as one of the documents that you used?

35 36

- 1 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 2 MR. ELKINS: You can answer. I will withdraw
- 3 the question.
- 4 Q. You have not produced this document that you are
- 5 referring to that you created, correct?
- 6 A. That is correct.
- 7 Q. Okay. That's fine. And your report, that
- 8 reports earnings all the way through 2073; is that
- 9 correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And that is when Ms. Salabarria is 81 or 82
- 12 years old, correct?
- 13 A. Yes, but those earnings in the later part of her
- 14 life are pension earned.
- 15 Q. When do you stop? Is it 2047 where the work
- 16 place earnings stop? That is when she is 56; is that
- 17 right?
- 18 A. That is correct.
- 19 Q. So you have earnings running from an additional
- 20 20 plus years, correct?
- 21 A. Give or take. I mean, from like when she is 30
- 22 something, 33 something to 36, right --
- 23 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 24 A. -- yes
- 25 Q. Are you familiar with what front pay is?

- 1 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 2 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 3 A. I have heard the term. Off the top of my head,
- 4 I can't recall what it is.
- 5 Q. Okay. So you didn't consider issues related to
- 6 front pay in formulating your report, did you?
 - MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 8 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 9 A. No.

7

- 10 Q. Okay. And you didn't consider anything
- 11 involving mitigation of damages in creating your report,
- 12 did you?
- 13 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 14 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 15 A. In a sense that -- Well, I took into account
- 16 what she earned after her dismissal and the years
- 17 involved and use that to project into the future. I did
- 18 take into account mitigation of damages.
- 19 Q. Okay. Fair enough. And your report going
- 20 forward presumes that Ms. Salabarria or Guasto would
- have remained employed all the way through age 56 and
- 22 inability to DROP, correct?
- 23 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 24 A. In the previous termination case, yes.
- 25 Q. I am sorry. Say that again.

Coastal Reporting, Inc. (954) 523-5326

10 (Pages 37 to 40)

38

37

- 1 A. In the pretermination case, yes.
- 2 Q. What do you mean by the pretermination case?
- 3 A. Well, the assumption of what she would have
- 4 earned pretermination.
- 5 O. Had she not been terminated?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Right. But you would agree with me that there
- 8 is no guarantee that she would have remained employed
- 9 all the way through to age 56?
- 10 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- MR. ELKINS: I am not done.
- 12 Q. She could have been terminated for some other
- 13 reason. Your report presumes she makes it all the way
- 14 to age 56, correct?
- 15 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 16 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 17 A. Yes. And the reason is that my responsibility
- 18 is to produce numbers related to loss during capacity,
- 19 and that seemed like the reasonable lost earning
- 20 capacity.
- 21 Q. Right. And then the pension and retirement
- 22 numbers are based on the calculation from I think the
- 23 DROP program through the Florida Retirement System
- 24 assuming she enters DROP?
- 25 A. Correct.

- 1 Q. Okay. Perfect. One second. All right. I am
- showing you what I am going to mark as Exhibit 3.
 - (Exhibit is marked for identification.)
- 4 Q. You see this document?
- 5 A. I do

3

- 6 Q. This is part of the documents that were produced
- 7 in this case. You can see it is Bates stamped at the
- 8 bottom?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. I am going to scroll down and show it to you
- 11 because it seems like there may be overlaps with the
- 12 document. This is the order in which this portion was
- 13 produced. So the first one talks about FRS, Florida
- 14 Retirement System retirement eligibility?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Okay. Then the next page looks like a
- 17 continuation of that. You can see at the top Florida
- 18 Retirement System Retirement Eligibility, correct?
- 19 A. Yes
- 20 Q. Okay. Then there is this document that looks
- 21 like it is from Asset that says: "Have questions about
- 22 your taxes?" And then we will come back to that. Then
- 23 again, we have the next document is a Florida Retirement
- 24 System document entitled: "For Investment Plan Members,
- 25 When Your Florida Retirement System Employment Ends,

39

- Your Florida Retirement system Investment Plan
- 2 Distribution Options and Special Tax Notice from July
- 3 **2023."**
- 4 Do you see that?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And then there is an additional page. It looks
- 7 like it is a cover page of a larger document. And then
- 8 it looks like the next page is Page 16.
- 9 **Do you see that?**
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. So let's back up. This document in the
- 12 middle of what I am going to call the FRS documents,
- 13 what is this document?
- 14 A. Can I look at my copy?
- 15 Q. You can as long as you are only going to look at
- 16 this document. You are free to do that, yes.
- 17 A. Okay. It was stapled to the back of something
- 18 else.
- 19 Q. Fair. As long as you are only looking at this
- 20 document, I am okay with it.
- 21 A. I am looking at just this document.
- 22 Q. Okay. What is this document?
- 23 A. This is a document where I looked at what the
- 24 tax liability would be for an income equivalent to what
- 25 I estimated for 2023 for Ms. Salabarria.

- 1 Q. Okay. So you plugged in. You used this online
 - 2 tool, I am assuming, from the web site asset and plugged
 - 3 in the information?
 - 4 A. Correct.
 - 5 Q. And is this all, is this everything that you got
 - 6 when you did that? Is this a full and complete
 - 7 production of everything you got or used from the web
 - 8 site Smartasset.com?
 - 9 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
 - 10 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
 - 11 A. Do you have a page that says "Overview of
 - 12 Federal Income Tax."
 - 13 Q. Well, hold on. We will get to that. I just
 - 14 wanted to know sitting here today. You are not allowed
 - 15 -- You have to stop taking documents and looking at them
 - 16 during the deposition. It is completely inappropriate.
 - 17 This is the third time you have done it.
 - MR. BARROUKH: Dr. Mason, I am going to ask you
 - 19 to stay only on the document Mr. Elkins is asking you to
 - 20 look at and no other documents unless he instructs
 - 21 otherwise. Thank you.
 - 22 A. Okay. The reason I looked at that is it is Page
 - 23 1 of the two pages from a set of 15 pages that I used to
 - 24 estimate Ms. Salabarria's tax liability for the year
 - 25 2023.

11 (Pages 41 to 44)

42

44

41

- 1 Q. All I am asking about is the documents from this
- 2 web site Smartasset.com as it is known in the lower
- 3 left-hand corner. It is like Page 2 of 15, but it was
- 4 produced in the middle of these other Florida Retirement
- 5 System documents. You can see the Bates number runs 31,
- 6 32, 33.
- 7 So it is unclear to me how this document, Bates
- 8 No. 000032 fits with the other documents. Are you
- 9 saying the other 14 documents were produced?
- 10 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 11 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 12 A. Yeah, I scanned in the documents. I didn't pay
- 13 much attention to the order in which they were scanned
- 14 in, but this document was used to determine the tax rate
- 15 for the year 2023.
- 16 Q. Okay. And it looks like nobody else paid
- 17 attention to the order either. All right.
- 18 So for now, going back to the FRS Retirement
- 19 Eligibility document, at the bottom of this document it
- 20 says Page 1 of 3. It looks like you got this off the
- 21 Miami-Dade County web site, right, from Human Resources,
- 22 correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And then I have Page 2 of 3. You see that?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Then we have mixed in the middle, the production
- 2 from SmartAsset.com, which is not related to the Florida
- 3 Retirement System, correct?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 6 MR. ELKINS: Whatever.
- 7 Q. And then I have this cover page to the Florida
- 8 Retirement System, which does not relate to the earlier
- 9 document, that looks to be three pages, you would agree
- 10 with me, correct?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Then I have Page 16 from a document from
- 13 MyFRS.com. Did you produce Page 3 of this first set of
- 14 documents?
- 15 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- 16 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 17 A. I did not because the information that was used
- 18 that was required was on that Page 2.
- 19 Q. So whatever Page 3 -- So, first of all, the
- 20 document FRS Retirement Eligibility, Bates number ending
- in 30, it is a three-page document. You only produced
- 22 Pages 1 and 2. You omitted Page 3 on purpose, correct?
- 23 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 25 A. I didn't omit it on purpose. I just didn't find

43

- 1 anything on that page that was useful, so I didn't
- 2 submit it
- 3 Q. Okay. So you purposely intentionally did not
- 4 submit Page 3, correct?
- 5 MR. BARROUKH: Objection. You are
- 6 mischaracterizing the testimony.
- 7 MR. ELKINS: I'm not impugning his character the
- 8 reason why he purposely omitted is one thing, but I
- 9 think it is crystal clear you intentionally did not
- 10 produce Page 3. That you want to read that in as bad,
- 11 that is fine, but it wasn't an accident, correct?
- 12 A. No, it was unnecessary.
- 13 Q. Okay. But again, it was not an oversight that
- 4 it wasn't produced, right?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. It wasn't an accident that two wasn't produced,
- 17 was it?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. It was consciously not produced, correct?
- 20 A. Yes
- 21 Q. Okay. Also going now to this handbook, it looks
- 22 like it is some sort for investment plan negotiations
- within your employment and dated July 23rd, Bates number
- 24 ending in Plaintiff's 33. It looks like this is the
- 25 corresponding page. Then you only produced Page 16 of

- 1 this what I am going to call a handbook; is that
- 2 accurate?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And you got that information from MyFRS.com
- 5 which is a web site relating to the Florida Retirement
- 6 System, correct?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. And these Florida Retirement System
- 9 documents, just so I understand and I understand what
- 10 you are telling me, this is the only information you
- 11 used from them these helped form the basis and are
- 12 considered as part of your expert opinion as to Ms.
- 13 Salabarria's potential future earnings, correct?
 - MR. BARROUKH: Objection.
- MR. ELKINS: You can answer.
- 16 A. This actually refers to future fringe benefits
- 17 after retirement.
- 18 Q. Okay. But you considered that as part of your
- 19 opinion, correct --
- 20 A. Yes.

14

- 21 Q. -- future fringe benefits under Florida
- 22 Retirement System?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Okay. That's all I am trying to conform.
- 25 A. Okay.

Coastal Reporting, Inc. (954) 523-5326

45

12 (Pages 45 to 48)

46

1 Q. And then for the incomplete three-page document,

2 FRS Retirement Eligibility, you considered that in

3 calculating Ms. Salabarria's eligibility for retirement

4 going forward, correct?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And did you also use the Florida Retirement

7 System pension calculations for calculating her earnings

going forward through when she DROP's and is getting her

9 pension?

10

MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

11 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

12 A. I am sorry. Ask that question again, please.

13 Q. Yeah. Did you -- I am just confirming what I

14 think happened: You used the calculations that the

15 Florida Retirement System used for pension in your

16 calculations, right?

17 A. Yes.

18 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

19 Q. And there is a formula for calculating pension.

20 Everybody has a different formula, right?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Okay. So you used the Florida Retirement System

23 as a basis for calculating Ms. Salabarria's pension?

24 MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

25 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

1 A. Yes.

5

2 MR. ELKINS: Let's take five. I might be close

3 to being finished.

4 (Off the record.)

BY MR. ELKINS:

6 Q. A couple more things: What is your hourly rate

7 in this case?

8 A. \$400 an hour.

9 Q. One second. Sorry. I am just attempting to

O share my screen here. One minute. Okay. Going back to

11 your report or updated report which was marked as

12 Exhibit 2, where it says here: "I billed Mr. Barroukh

13 for my report" -- Do you see it is blank there?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. So did you fill out this report before you

16 submitted it?

17 A. I didn't get -- I knew the deposition was coming

18 up, so I never sent him a bill yet.

19 Q. How much have you been paid so far for your

20 services? Don't look at documents, sir.

21 A. How can I not look at documents to find out how

22 much I have been paid?

23 Q. I am going to answer that question for you. As

24 somebody that has been deposed a thousand times, as you

25 told me before, that is a pretty basic rule for

47 48

depositions. Listen to me carefully: You were supposed

to prepare for this deposition. You were supposed to

3 come here with basic information. And any expert

4 witness who has testified as how many times you have

5 told me, you would know that you are going to be asked

6 about your compensation.

So the answer to your question, sir, is that you should have been prepared. You are not allowed to look

9 at documents during your deposition. So I will ask you

10 again. If you don't know, you can just tell me you

11 don't know?

7

How much have you been paid to this point for

13 your services?

14 MR. BARROUKH: Michael, I am going to object on

15 being argumentative with the witness.

MR. ELKINS: That's fine. The witness is

17 engaging in unethical conduct. I want it on the record

18 so I can bring it to the Judge's attention. My question

19 stands: How much have you been paid to this point for

20 your services?

25

21 THE WITNESS: And I will also --

MR. BARROUKH: I am going --

MR. ELKINS: The witness is arguing with me

24 about it. He has given a cockamamie statement.

THE WITNESS: How am I supposed to get the

1 answer without looking at --

MR. BARROUKH: I understand. Let's continue the

3 questioning in a civil manner and let's continue.

4 MR. ELKINS: I am being very civil. Answer the

5 question.

6 A. \$2,100.

7 Q. Are you sure?

8 A. Yes

9 Q. Okay. And how much do you anticipate billing

10 going forward including today's deposition?

MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

12 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

13 A. Another \$2,000 or so.

14 Q. How much are you charging for this deposition

15 today?

16 A. \$800, if it lasts less than two hours.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. Which that's three --

19 O. That's what?

20 A. Well, that's a half hour from now, so we should

21 be good.

22 Q. We will see.

23 A. Okay.

24 Q. I am showing you what I am going to mark as

25 **Exhibit 4.**

49

13 (Pages 49 to 52)

1 (Exhibit is marked for identification.)

2 Q. This is an e-mail between you and Mr. Barroukh's

3 office. I believe Mr. Rodriguez is a paralegal there.

4 And then this second page is a letter from you to Mr.

5 Barroukh. It says: "This letter constitutes my bill in

6 the Salabarria case for the time spent on this case

7 since I took over. I spent four hours on the case

8 including time to review additional documents, revise my

9 previous spreadsheet as a result and write attached

10 report at my hourly rate of \$400. And the total amount

11 due for this portion is \$1,600."

12 **Do you see that?**

13 A. I do.

14 Q. Have you been paid that \$1,600 yet?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Okay. So the \$2,100 you just told me about

17 earlier does not include this \$1,600, correct?

18 A. Yes, it does.

19 Q. Okay. I think you just testified earlier that

20 you have been paid \$2,100 in this case up to this point,

21 correct?

1

3

22 A. That is correct, but that was paid by the

23 previous attorney.

24 Q. Okay. And I just asked you if that \$2,100

25 includes this \$1,600, and you just said it does.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. But I also asked you if you had been paid this

3 \$1,600 and you said --

4 A. No, I hadn't gotten it yet, no.

5 Q. Let's back up.

6 A. Okay.

7 Q. How much have you actually been paid up to this

8 point, if you remember or know?

9 A. \$2,100.

10 Q. You physically received \$2,100, correct?

11 A. I did receive a retainer of \$800 and another

12 \$1,300 for writing the report.

13 Q. Okay. So you have, you physically received, the

14 \$1,600 that I am referencing in this Exhibit 4?

15 A. No

16 Q. Okay. So logically, correct me if I am wrong,

17 the \$2,100 does not include this \$1,600, correct?

18 A. That is correct.

19 **Q.** Okay.

20 A. I am sorry. I misunderstood the question.

21 **Q.** Okay.

22 A. And the reason is because the amount that I am

23 still owed is also close to \$2,100.

24 Q. That's fine. One more thing --

MR. BARROUKH: There are also two reports which

51

may contribute to the confusion.

MR. ELKINS: I think the issue is clarified.

MR. BARROUKH all right.

4 Q. All right. I am showing you what I am marking

5 as Exhibit 5.

6 (Exhibit is marked for identification.)

7 Q. Do you see this document? It is five pages.

8 A. Yes

9 Q. These are what I believe are estimates of

10 statements of retirement benefits. You see this?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Okay. How did you get these documents?

13 A. They were provided to me.

14 Q. Okay. And how did these documents assist you in

15 forming your opinion in this case?

16 A. I use those documents to identify Ms.

17 Salabarria's retirement income post dismissal.

18 Q. For the estimates? You mean, through -- Hold

19 on. I am sorry. You said her retirement income post

20 dismissal?

21 A. Correct. Since she was vested in the retirement

22 plan, she will receive some retirement income in the

23 future, just not nearly as much as if she had not been

24 dismissed.

25 Q. But your calculations are based upon her having

1 not been dismissed, right? Your report is had she not

2 been dismissed, this is what she would have earned going

3 forward, and this is what she would have gotten through

4 the pension. Correct?

MR. BARROUKH: Objection.

6 MR. ELKINS: You can answer.

7 A. That is the part which is predismissal earnings,

8 that projected predismissal. But it also projected post

9 dismissal earnings which included this much smaller

10 amount of pension based on her being vested at the time

11 of dismissal.

5

12 Q. I see. So the document I just showed you in

13 Exhibit 5 were used for that limited category that I

14 think you just said, right? What is it again?

15 A. The retirement that's post dismissal as a result

16 of her being vested.

17 Q. Okay. I see. So that's what the document in

18 Exhibit 5 were used for?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Okay. And then the Florida Retirement System

and the DROP calculation, that is all used to calculate

22 the bigger number which is the future earnings and then

23 the DROP earnings; is that correct?

24 A. That is correct.

MR. ELKINS: Perfect. Okay. I don't have any

Coastal Reporting, Inc.

50

14 (Pages 53 to 56)

53 54 further questions. COURT REPORTER: Would the witness like to read 1 1 2 MR. BARROUKH I just have one question. 2 or waive? 3 **CROSS-EXAMINATION** 3 THE WITNESS: Read. 4 BY MR. BARROUKH: 4 (The deposition concluded at 11:36 a.m.) 5 5 О. On the previous document Mr. Elkins showed you -I don't have the exhibit at this time - did you access 6 6 7 7 any public web sites to obtain the information where Mr. 8 Elkins showed you Page 1 and Page 2, but Page 3 was not 8 9 9 produced? 10 10 Was that a public web site, if you remember? 11 I believe so, yes. 11 A. 12 12 And does anyone have access to that public web Q. 13 site? 13 14 MR. ELKINS: Form. 14 15 A. Yes. 15 16 MR. BARROUKH: All right. Thank you. That's 16 17 it. I have nothing else. Okay. Wait. I left out a 17 18 few things. First of all, I am going to put the 18 19 exhibits in the chat. We are ordering. I am actually 19 going to order it expedite and mini only. 20 COURT REPORTER: When do you need it? 21 21 22 MR. ELKINS: Next week. 22 23 COURT REPORTER: Do you need a copy, Daniel? 23 24 MR. BARROUKH: I am going to hold off for now. 24 25 I will get in touch with you if I want to order. 25 55 56 1 CERTIFICATE OF OATH 1 REPORTER'S DEPOSITION CERTIFICATE 2 2 3 3 STATE OF FLORIDA) 4 4 COUNTY OF BROWARD) 5 5 6 STATE OF FLORIDA) 6 I, SUSAN BARNARD, Professional Shorthand Court 7 Reporter, certify that I was authorized to and did 8 COUNTY OF BROWARD) stenographically report the remote deposition of 9 PAUL M. MASON, PhD, that a review of the transcript was 10 I, the undersigned authority, certify that requested; and that the transcript is a true and 11 complete record of my stenographic notes. 11 PAUL M. MASON, PhD, remotely appeared before me and was I further certify that I am not a relative. 12 12 duly sworn. employee, attorney, or counsel of any of the parties, 13 13 14 nor am I a relative or employee of any of the parties' 14 15 attorney or counsel connected with the action, nor am I 15 WITNESS my hand and official seal this 23rd day of 16 financially interested in the action. 16 April, 2024. 17 17 18 Dated this 23rd day of April, 2024. 18 19 graf July 19 20 20 21 SUSAN BARNARD 21 22 Notary Public, SUSAN BARNARD State of Florida 22 23 Notary Public, State of Florida My Commission No. HH 408027 My Commission No. HH 408027 23 Expires: June 16, 2027 24 Expires: June 16, 2027 24 25 25

15 (Pages 57 to 58)

	10 (14900 07 00 007
57	58
1 ERRATASHEET 2 DO NOT WRITE ON THE TRANSCRIPT - ENTER CHANGES 3 IN RE: GUASTO VS. THE CITY OF MIAMI BEACH CASE NO: 1:22-CV-21004-DPG 4 DATE: APRIL 19, 2024 DEPONENT NAME: PAUL M. MASON, PhD 5	1 APRIL 23, 2024 2 PAUL M. MASON, PhD C/O DANIEL BARROUKH, ESQ. 3 Derek Smith Law Group, PLLC 520 Brickell Key Drive 4 Suite O-301 Miami, Florida 33131-2433 5
6 PAGE/LINE CORRECTION REASON 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Deposition of DR. PAUL M. MASON This letter is to advise you that the transcript taken in the above-referenced deposition has been transcribed. Please contact our office at (954)523-5326 to make arrangements to read and sign or sign below to waive review of the transcript. It is suggested that the review of this transcript be completed within 30 days of your receipt of this letter as considered reasonable under Federal Rules*; however, there is no Florida Statute to this regard. The original of this transcript has been forwarded to the ordering party and your errata, once received.
17 (Use other side if necessary) 18 Under penalties of perjury, I declare that I have read the foregoing document and that the facts stated 19 are true. 20 21 PAUL M. MASON, PhD DATE 22 23 24 25	will be forwarded to all ordering parties for inclusion in the transcript. Very tradering parties for inclusion in the transcript. Very tradering parties for inclusion in the transcript. Very tradering parties for inclusion in the transcript. Waiver: I, , hereby waive the reading and signing of my deposition transcript. DEPONENT DATE *Federal Civil Procedure Rule 30(e)Florida Civil

	ı	ı	ı	1
A	50:22 52:10	41:1	background	41:7 42:20
a.m 1:16,16 54:4	and/or 14:16	asks 9:24 14:18	4:11 7:4	43:23
Abilene 8:20	answer 9:14	asset 38:21 40:2	backwards 17:8	Beach 1:8 4:16
above-referen	11:2 13:14	assist 51:14	bad 43:10	27:17 28:20
58:8	15:8 16:8,9,12	associated 29:23	Barnard 1:24	29:11,12 57:3
Absolutely 6:20	20:10 21:11,15	assume 19:23	55:21 56:6,22	58:6
6:20 16:4	21:16,18 24:15	assuming 37:24	58:18	began 8:17
access 53:6,12	25:4,18 26:7	40:2	Barroukh 2:2	BEHALF 2:6,10
accident 43:11	26:16,18 27:19	assumption 37:3	3:8 5:20 6:13	believe 8:16
43:16	28:2,7 29:15	assumptions	6:14,20 9:9	11:18 15:12
accompanied	31:7,19 32:3,4	6:25 13:1	11:1 12:6,18	17:5,21,22
17:3	32:23 33:16	attached 49:9	13:5 14:17,24	20:25 22:7
account 30:7	34:10,20 35:2	attachment	15:12,21 16:4	23:24 29:17
36:15,18	36:2,8,14	12:19	16:11 17:21	49:3 51:9
accurate 12:17	37:16 40:10	attempted 21:18	20:8,18 21:10	53:11
12:23 22:16,17	41:11 42:16,24	attempting 46:9	22:18 24:12	benefit 31:2,2
28:15 44:2	44:15 45:11,25	attention 41:13	25:3,7,11,17	benefits 44:16
acronym 30:9	46:23 47:7	41:17 47:18	26:6,13,23	44:21 51:10
Act 25:2,16	48:1,4,12 52:6	attorney 6:24,24	27:6,9,9,11,18	best 28:15
action 56:15,16	answering 32:21	18:20,21 49:23	27:23 28:1,5	bigger 52:22
added 32:14	33:3	56:13,15	29:14 30:13	bill 46:18 49:5
additional 6:24	anticipate 48:9	attorney-client	31:5,16,18	billed 46:12
10:9,11 16:6	anyway 26:10	6:19	32:2,18,19	billing 48:9
16:17 35:19	APPEARANC	attorneys 5:16	33:1,14 34:1,9	birth 20:12
39:6 49:8	2:1	August 19:19	34:19 35:1,23	bit 34:8
additionally	appeared 55:11	23:17	36:1,7,13,23	blank 46:13
23:15	APPEARING	Austin 7:10	37:10,15 40:9	bolster 30:20
administrative	2:6,10	authority 55:10	40:18 41:10	bottom 38:8
7:13	April 1:15 16:21	authorized 56:7	42:5,15,23	41:19
advantage 22:14	55:16 56:18	average 34:12	43:5 44:14	break 9:19
adversely 24:19	57:4 58:1	awarded 16:2	45:10,18,24	Brickell 2:3 58:3
advise 58:7	arbitration 7:14	awards 16:1	46:12 47:14,22	brief 6:12
afternoon 6:13	arguing 47:23	aware 15:11	48:2,11 49:5	bring 47:18
age 36:21 37:9	argumentative	25:5,6 28:22	50:25 51:3	broad-based
37:14	47:15	29:8	52:5 53:2,4,16	13:10
agree 37:7 42:9	arrangements		53:24 58:2	BROWARD
allegations 4:20	58:9	<u>B</u>	Barroukh's 49:2	55:8 56:4
allege 19:3	aside 21:16	B-5 9:23	based 25:9 31:25	bumps 30:25
allowed 21:13	asked 8:7 13:10	baby 20:13	34:11 37:22	31:1
40:14 47:8	21:17 26:8	Bachelor's 7:5	51:25 52:10	
amend 15:22	28:6 32:25	back 8:21 14:13	basic 46:25 47:3	$\frac{\mathbf{C}}{\mathbf{C}(\mathbf{C},\mathbf{C},\mathbf{C},\mathbf{C},\mathbf{C},\mathbf{C},\mathbf{C},\mathbf{C},$
34:3	47:5 49:24	16:21,22 17:7	basically 31:1	C/O 58:2
amended 16:2	50:2	38:22 39:11,17	basis 44:11	calculate 52:21
17:5 33:23	asking 9:11,12	41:18 46:10	45:23	calculating 45:3
amount 49:10	12:18 40:19	50:5	Bates 38:7 41:5	45:7,19,23

calculation 21:24 22:24 communication contact 58:8 56:13.15 31:25 37:22 22:14,24 23:7 23:11,14,20.23 company 18:19 continuation 38:17 30:24 31:10 31:20 32:17 31:20 32:17 38:21 4:4,10 38:17 componition 16:13 32:7 45:7,14 45:16 51:25 certain 30:24 22:19 47:6 48:2,3 contribute 51:1 conversation 6:23 39:12 certainly 6:17 28:3,6,6,7 completed 58:11 conversation 16:14 26:14 19:6,16,22 called 28:20 CERTIFICATE completed 58:11 completed 58:11 conversation 16:14 26:14 19:6,16,25 apacity 37:18 55:1 56:1 completed 58:11 completed 58:11 completed 58:11 completed 58:11 completed 58:11 core 71:14:17 core 71:14:17 core 71:14:17 core 72:18 55:18 68:36:11:17 core 71:18:18:24:25 58:18 core 74:13 core 7					Page 60
31:25 37:22 22:14,24 23:7 23:11,14,20,23 company 18:19 compensation 38:17 continue 16:13 35:7 45:7,14 date gory 52:13 date of 16:12,15,21 detail 30:24 date of 16:12,15,21 detail 30:24 date of 16:12 date of 16:12 date of 16:13 date of 17 date of 18:20 date of 18:2	aslaulation	21.24.22.2.4	aommunication	aontost 50.0	56.12.15
52:21 calculations 23:11,14,20,23 calculations 24:19,21 30:11 ompensation 38:17 continue 16:13 55:8 56:4 category 52:13 certain 30:24 32:17 called 28:20 called 28:20 called 28:20 called 28:20 called 28:20 care 15:24 career 22:6 carefully 47:1 case 1:3 3:15 5:8 8:3,6 11:16,20 care 15:24 career 22:6 carefully 47:1 case 1:3 3:15 5:8 8:3,6 11:16,20 care 15:24 career 22:6 character 43:7 charging 48:14 21:25,7:25 21:79,10,13,15 17:17,17,18 18:44,10,11,17 18:23 19:12,13 19:15,19,21,24 20:6,10,14 21:27,25 22:7 22:20,21,24 22:20,21,24 22:20,21,24 22:20,21,24 22:20,21,24 22:20,21,24 23:3,18,19,24,25 23:18,19,24,25 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 23:30 36:24 37:12,238:7 doi: 74:24 20:0s.8 16,19 33:20 36:24 47:3 come 16:1 38:22 47:3 2ases 8:6,14,19 10:28,16,19 11:141 16:16,24 18:1819,3,18 23:11,14,20,23 compensation 23:0compensation 23:0compensation 23:0compensation 23:0compensation 23:22 21:44,10 47:6 48:2,3 contribute 51:1 conversations 25:76 16:14 26:14 42:21 conversations 25:76 17:12,18 complete 40:6 56:11 completed 90:6 56:11 com		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
calculations 24:19,21 30:11 compensation continue 16:13 55:8 56:4 couple 27:2 46:6 co		,			
30:24 31:10 31:27 45:7,14 45:16 51:25 call 6:12,15,21 6:23 39:12 44:1 7:23 22:19 called 28:20 called 28:20 23:11 CERTIFICATE 37:20 56:7,12 care 15:24 care 15:24 care 22:6 care 119:47:1 case 1:3 3:15 5:8 8:3,6 11:16,20 12:3,5 1:3:3,25 14:13 15:25 17:9,10,13,15 17:17,17,18 18:23 19:12,13 19:15,19,21,24 20:6,10,14 20:11 20		/ / /		'	
32:7 45:7,14 45:16 51:25 certain 30:24 32:17 28:3,6,6,7 16:14 26:14 14:8 18:24,25 17:12,18 11:7,19,24 14:25 27:21 complete 40:6 comple		/	_		
45:16 51:25 call 6:12,15,21 certain 30:24 32:17 Complaint 4:24 4:25 27:21 contribute 51:1 conversation 5:7 6:1 7:12,18 11:7,19,24 12:2,25:2 11:7,29,10,13,15 17:17,17,18 18:23 19:12,13 27:16 31:14 19:15,19,21,24 57:3 58:6 eivil 9:7,22 25:2 20,21,24 22:2,0,21,24 22:2,0,21,24 23:7,16,17,17 22:2,0,21,24 23:7,16,17,17 22:2,0,21,24 23:7,16,17,17 22:2,0,21,24 12:2,7,25 22:7 22:2,0,21,24 12:2,7,25 22:7 22:2,0,21,24 23:7,16,17,17 23:3,38,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 57:3 come 16:1 38:22 46:7 49:20 51:15 57:3 come 16:1 38:22 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 57:3 come 16:1 38:22 11:2,15 13:6,7 13:19 10:2,8,16,19 1			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
call 6:12,15,21 32:17 certainly 6:17 4:25 27:21 conversation 11:7,19,24 14:8 18:24,25 called 28:20 23:11 complete 40:6 conversations 16:14 26:14 14:8 18:24,25 called 28:20 23:11 completed 40:6 conversations 19:6,16,25 24:13 certify 55:10 56:7,12 completely 53:23 correct 5:9,10 58:18 care 15:24 cetera 25:10 change 24:2 completell 11:6 correct 5:9,10 cover 39:7 42:7 cover 39:7 42	*			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	·
6:23 39:12 certainly 6:17 7:23 22:19 complete 40:6 56:14 conversations 26:22 26:9 53:21,23 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·</td></t<>					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
44:1 called 28:20 7:23 22:19 23:11 complete 40:6 56:11 conversations 56:11 19:6,16,25 26:9 53:21,23 27:17,22 28:10 27:17,22 28:16					
called 28:20 calls 9:9 20:8 24:13 23:11 CERTIFICATE 55:10 55:1 56:1 completed 58:11 55:11 completed 58:11 completed 58:13 53:23 53:24,23 54:1 56:6 58:18 cover 39:7 42:7 covered 6:18 cover 39:7 42:7 covered 6:18 comply 10:23 11:16 cover 39:7 42:7 covered 6:18 cover 39:7 42:7 cov			1 1 1		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
calls 9:9 20:8 24:13 CERTIFICATE 55:1 56:1 completed 58:11 completely copy 39:14 53:23 corner 41:3 corner 41:3 correct 5:9,10 corner 41:3 corpleted 58:11 completely 53:23 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 58:18 correct 6:18 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 65:1 56:1 completely 65:1 58:18 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 65:1 58:18 correct 3:7 covered 6:18 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 11:14;11 13:23 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 8:5 10:17,18 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 11:14;11 created 30:20 32:13 33:17 sompleted 58:11 completely 32:13 33:17 sompleted 58:11 completely 32:13 33:17 sompleted 58:11 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 65:1 58:18 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:11 completely 65:1 58:18 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:12 completed 58:12 completed 58:12 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:15 completed 58:12 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:12 correct 5:9,10 completed 58:15 correct 5:9,10			_		1 ' '
24:13 capacity 37:18 55:1 56:1 certify 55:10 completely 40:16 53:23 corner 41:3 correct 5:9,10 correct 5:12 correct 5:16:11 correct 5:12 correct 5:16 correct 5:15 correct 5:16 correct 5:15 correct 5:18					· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
capacity 37:18 37:20 certify 55:10 56:7,12 40:16 compled 11:3 compled 11:3 corect 5:9,10 dompled 11:3 corect 5:9,10 dompled 11:3 corect 5:9,10 dompled 11:3 coreated 30:20 32:13 33:17 cover 39:7 42:7 covered 6:18 40:16 compled 11:3 compled 11:3 compled 11:3 compled 11:3 compled 11:3 dompled 11:3 dompled 11:3 dompled 11:3 corect 5:9,10 dompled 11:3 dompled 22:2 dos:16 doi:10 dompled 11:3 dompled 11:4 dompled 11:3 dompled 11:3 dompled 11:4 dompled 11:3 dompled 11:4 dompled 11:3 dompled 11:4				1 4	
37:20 56:7,12 cetera 25:10 change 24:2 charefully 47:1 case 1:3 3:15 5:8 character 43:7 charging 48:14 chat 53:19 12:3,5 13:3,25 14:13 15:25 child 20:11 routh 19:25 17:17,17,18 result 19:25 22:20,21;2,4 20:6,10,14 21:2,7,25 22:7 22:20,21,24 23:17,16,17,17 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 25:16 26:1 27:13 33:8,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 57:3 case 8:6,14,19 10:28,816,19 10:28,22 commission complied 11:3 compled 11:3 (correct 5:9,10 8:5 10:11:14,17 13:23 10:21,22 11:10 (reated 30:20 32:13 33:17					
care 15:24 career 22:6 carefully 47:1 case 1:3 3:15 5:8 character 43:7 charging 48:14 chat 53:19 12:3,5 13:3,25 14:13 15:25 17:9,10,13,15 17:17,17,18 18:23 19:12,13 19:15,19,21,24 20:6,10,14 21:27,25 22:7 22:20,21,24 23:31,6,17,17 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 25:16 26:1 27:13 33:8,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 57:3 case 8:6,14,19 10:28,8,16,19 11:16 17:17 (charging 48:14 chat 53:19 check 13:16,21 child 20:11 sit 24:13 child 20:11 child 20:1	- v				
career 22:6 change 24:2 CHANGES 57:2 computer 21:16 11:16 10:21,22 11:10 created 30:20 32:13 33:17 35:55 creating 8:5 35:12 35:13 36:11 CROSS 3:7 creating 8:5 36:11 CROSS 3:7 CROSS 3:7 CROSS 5:2 CROSS 5:2 CROSS 5:3 CROSS 5:3 CROSS 5:3 Creating 30:20 36:11 31:9,10,15 33:19,10,15 33:21,73,23,24 42:7,24 26:25 CROSS 5:3 CROSS 5:3 CROSS 5:3 CROSS 5:3 CROSS 5:3 Creating 8:5 33:21,73,24 24:7,24 26:25 CROSS 5:3 Creating 8:5 33:21,73,24 24:7,24 26:25 CROSS 5:4 23:11 27:17,22 28:16 <th< td=""><td></td><td>· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·</td><td></td><td>· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·</td><td></td></th<>		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Carefully 47:1 CHANGES 57:2 character 43:7 colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">colspan="3">c			1 1	1	
case 1:3 3:15 5:8 character 43:7 21:18,21 17:12 19:7 35:5 creating 8:5 8:3,6 11:16,20 12:3,5 13:3,25 14:13 15:25 chat 53:19 concerned 7:25 22:22 23:2,9 36:11 36:11 17:9,10,13,15 17:17,17,18 child 20:11 conclusion 9:10 27:17,22 28:16 CROSS 3:7 CROSS-EXA 18:23 19:12,13 27:16 31:14 conduct 47:17 31:9,10,15 53:3 crystal 43:9 19:15,19,21,24 57:3 58:6 1:17 36:22 37:14,25 38:18 40:4 36:22 37:14,25 20:6,10,14 21:18,19,24,25 25:16 48:3,4 45:13 42:10,22 43:4 43:11,19 44:6 23:18,19,24,25 27:16 conform 44:24 43:11,19 44:6 44:13,19 45:4 24:4,5,16 clarified 51:2 confusion 51:1 25:16 26:1 49:17,21,22 58:2 25:16 26:1 15:17 43:9 consciously 43:19 27:15 53:23 27:15 53:23 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 47:24 36:5,10 57:6 27:11 53:23 28:24 column 34:13 con			_	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
8:3,6 11:16,20 12:3,5 13:3,25 14:13 15:25 17:9,10,13,15 17:17,17,18 18:4,10,11,17 18:23 19:12,13 19:15,19,21,24 20:6,10,14 21:2,7,25 22:7 22:17,22 25:2 23:12,13,23,24 20:6,10,14 20:11 27:16 31:14 57:3 58:6 civil 9:7,22 25:2 23:12,13,23,24 20:6,10,14 20:21:2,7,25 22:7 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 25:16 26:1 27:13 33:8,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 49:20 51:15 57:3 concluded 54:4 conclusion 9:10 9:13 24:13 31:9,10,15 53:3 conduct 47:17 CONFEREN 1:17 confident 22:4 confirming 45:13 confirming 45:13 4	•		_	· ·	
12:3,5 13:3,25			· ·		
14:13 15:25	, ,	00	concerned 7:25	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
17:9,10,13,15	12:3,5 13:3,25	chat 53:19	concerns 9:23	1 1 1	
17:17,17,18	14:13 15:25	check 13:16,21	concluded 54:4	24:7,24 26:25	CROSS 3:7
18:4,10,11,17 city 1:8 4:16 conduct 47:17 32:1,7 35:5,6,9 crystal 43:9 cut 8:21 18:23 19:12,13 27:16 31:14 57:3 58:6 1:17 36:22 37:14,25 36:22 37:14,25 38:18 40:4 21:2,7,25 22:7 25:16 48:3,4 confirming 41:22 42:3,4 42:10,22 43:4 42:10,22 43:4 42:10,22 43:4 43:11,19 44:6 43:11,19 44:6 44:13,19 45:4 42:10,22 43:4 43:11,19 44:6 44:13,19 45:4 44:13,19 45:4 44:13,19 45:4 44:13,19 45:4 44:13,19 45:4 44:13,19 45:4 49:17,21,22 15:1,24 27:6 27:11 53:23 58:2 58:2 58:2 58:2 58:2 58:2 58:2 58:2 59:10,16,17,18 27:11 53:23 27:11 53:23 58:2 58:2 59:10,16,17,18 27:11 53:23 58:2	17:9,10,13,15	child 20:11	conclusion 9:10	27:17,22 28:16	CROSS-EXA
18:23 19:12,13	17:17,17,18	circuit 19:25	9:13 24:13	31:9,10,15	53:3
19:15,19,21,24 20:6,10,14 20:6,10,14 21:2,7,25 22:7 25:16 48:3,4 22:20,21,24 58:25,25 23:7,16,17,17 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 24:4,5,16 25:16 26:1 27:13 33:8,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 57:3 cases 8:6,14,19 10:2,8,16,19 10:2,8,16,19 10:2,8,16,19 14:14 16:16,24 18:8 19:3,18 19:3,18	18:4,10,11,17	city 1:8 4:16	conduct 47:17	32:1,7 35:5,6,9	crystal 43:9
20:6,10,14	18:23 19:12,13	27:16 31:14	CONFEREN	35:12,18,20	cut 8:21
21:2,7,25 22:7 22:20,21,24 23:7,16,17,17 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 25:16 26:1 27:13 33:8,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 57:3 cases 8:6,14,19 10:2,8,16,19 14:14 16:16,24 18:8 19:3,18 25:16 48:3,4 58:25,25 confirming 45:13 conform 44:24 confused 15:1 confusing 23:25 conform 44:24 confusing 23:25 confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consider 22:13 36:18 41:22 42:3,4 42:10,22 43:4 43:11,19 44:6 43:11,19 44:6 44:13,19 45:4 49:17,21,22 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 27:11 53:23 58:2 27:11 53:23 58:2 Danielb@dere 2:5 Daragjati 12:4 12:15 13:6,7 13:19 data 13:11 32:10 36:18 Daniel 2:2 13:9 15:1,24 27:6 27:11 53:23 58:2 Danielb@dere 2:5 Daragjati 12:4 12:15 13:6,7 13:19 data 13:11 32:10 36:18 Daniel 2:2 13:9 15:1,24 27:6 27:11 53:23 58:2 Danielb@dere 2:5 Daragjati 12:4 12:15 13:6,7 13:19 data 13:11 32:10 32:12 33:9,10 33:12 12:14 13:6	19:15,19,21,24	57:3 58:6	1:17	36:22 37:14,25	
22:20,21,24 23:7,16,17,17 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 25:16 26:1 27:13 33:8,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 49:20 51:15 47:24 47:3 45:13 45:13 45:13 42:10,22 43:4 43:11,19 44:6 44:13,19 45:4 49:17,21,22 50:10,16,17,18 58:25 50:10,16,17,18 58:25 50:10,16,17,18 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 50:10,16,17,18 58:2 Consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Consider 22:13 36:18 Confusion 51:1 confusion 51:1 consciously 43:19 Conrectly 17:24 24:23 27:8 Corresponding 43:25 counsel 2:6,10 32:12 33:9,10 33:12 data 1:15 17:7	20:6,10,14	civil 9:7,22 25:2	confident 22:4	38:18 40:4	
23:7,16,17,17 23:18,19,24,25 24:4,5,16 25:16 26:1 27:13 33:8,19 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 57:3 cases 8:6,14,19 10:2,8,16,19 11:14 16:16,24 18:8 19:3,18 claims 22:25 27:16 confused 15:1 confusing 23:25 confusion 51:1 conf	21:2,7,25 22:7	25:16 48:3,4	confirming	41:22 42:3,4	_
23:7,16,17,17 claims 22:25 conform 44:24 43:11,19 44:6 36:18 23:18,19,24,25 27:16 confused 15:1 44:13,19 45:4 Daniel 2:2 13:9 24:4,5,16 clarified 51:2 confusing 23:25 49:17,21,22 15:1,24 27:6 25:16 26:1 15:17 43:9 confusion 51:1 50:10,16,17,18 27:11 53:23 27:13 33:8,19 15:17 43:9 consciously 51:21 52:4,23 58:2 33:12 38:7 close 46:2 50:23 consciously CORRECTION 2:5 46:7 49:6,6,7 47:24 36:5,10 correctly 17:24 12:15 13:6,7 57:3 column 34:13 come 16:1 38:22 8:22 corresponding data 13:11 32:10 10:2,8,16,19 47:3 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 date 1:15 17:7	22:20,21,24	58:25,25	_	42:10,22 43:4	damages 36:11
23:18,19,24,25 27:16 confused 15:1 44:13,19 45:4 Daniel 2:2 13:9 24:4,5,16 clarified 51:2 confusing 23:25 49:17,21,22 15:1,24 27:6 25:16 26:1 25:16 26:1 15:17 43:9 50:10,16,17,18 27:11 53:23 23:23 client 32:23 consciously 51:21 52:4,23 58:2 33:20 36:24 close 46:2 50:23 close 46:2 50:23 43:19 CORRECTION 49:20 51:15 47:24 36:5,10 consider 22:13 2:5 57:3 column 34:13 considerably 24:23 27:8 22:25 10:2,8,16,19 47:3 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 date 1:15 17:7		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	conform 44:24	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
24:4,5,16 clarified 51:2 confusing 23:25 49:17,21,22 15:1,24 27:6 25:16 26:1 clear 5:6 14:21 50:10,16,17,18 27:11 53:23 27:13 33:8,19 15:17 43:9 connected 56:15 51:21 52:4,23 58:2 33:20 36:24 client 32:23 consciously 52:24 CORRECTION 2:5 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 47:24 36:5,10 correctly 17:24 2:5 Daragjati 12:4 57:3 column 34:13 come 16:1 38:22 8:22 corresponding data 13:11 32:10 10:2,8,16,19 47:3 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 date 1:15 17:7					
25:16 26:1 clear 5:6 14:21 confusion 51:1 50:10,16,17,18 27:11 53:23 33:20 36:24 15:17 43:9 connected 56:15 51:21 52:4,23 58:2 37:1,2 38:7 close 46:2 50:23 43:19 consciously 57:6 49:20 51:15 47:24 36:5,10 correctly 17:24 12:15 13:6,7 57:3 come 16:1 38:22 8:22 considerably considered 33:7 43:25 13:19 10:2,8,16,19 47:3 considered 33:7 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 12:14 13:6					15:1,24 27:6
27:13 33:8,19 15:17 43:9 connected 56:15 51:21 52:4,23 58:2 33:20 36:24 37:1,2 38:7 close 46:2 50:23 43:19 CORRECTION 2:5 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 47:24 36:5,10 consider 22:13 57:6 Daragjati 12:4 57:3 column 34:13 come 16:1 38:22 8:22 correctly 17:24 13:19 10:2,8,16,19 47:3 considered 33:7 43:25 32:12 33:9,10 14:14 16:16,24 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 33:12	* *	clear 5:6 14:21		· · · · ·	27:11 53:23
33:20 36:24 client 32:23 consciously 52:24 Danielb@dere 37:1,2 38:7 46:7 49:6,6,7 cockamamie 43:19 CORRECTION 2:5 46:7 49:6,6,7 47:24 consider 22:13 57:6 Daragjati 12:4 57:3 column 34:13 considerably 24:23 27:8 13:19 cases 8:6,14,19 47:3 considered 33:7 24:23 27:8 24:23 27:8 23:12 33:9,10 14:14 16:16,24 47:3 considered 33:7 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 Counsel 2:6,10				1	58:2
37:1,2 38:7 close 46:2 50:23 43:19 CORRECTION 2:5 46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 47:24 36:5,10 correctly 17:24 12:15 13:6,7 57:3 come 16:1 38:22 8:22 considerably corresponding data 13:11 32:10 10:2,8,16,19 47:3 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 Corresponding 32:12 33:9,10	· ·			1	Danielb@dere
46:7 49:6,6,7 49:20 51:15 cockamamie 47:24 consider 22:13 36:5,10 57:6 correctly 17:24 Daragjati 12:4 12:15 13:6,7 57:3 cases 8:6,14,19 10:2,8,16,19 14:14 16:16,24 18:8 19:3,18 come 16:1 38:22 47:3 coming 46:17 Commission 8:22 considered 33:7 44:12,18 45:2 corresponding considered 33:7 44:12,18 45:2 data 13:11 32:10 32:12 33:9,10 36:5,10 considerably 8:22 considered 33:7 44:12,18 45:2 corresponding counsel 2:6,10 12:14 13:6 data 13:11 32:10 33:12 date 1:15 17:7					2:5
49:20 51:15 47:24 36:5,10 correctly 17:24 12:15 13:6,7 57:3 column 34:13 considerably 24:23 27:8 13:19 cases 8:6,14,19 47:3 considered 33:7 43:25 data 13:11 32:10 14:14 16:16,24 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 date 1:15 17:7	*				Daragjati 12:4
57:3 column 34:13 considerably 24:23 27:8 13:19 cases 8:6,14,19 60me 16:1 38:22 8:22 60me 16:1 38:21 60me 16:1 38:22 60me 16:1 38:22 60me 16:1 38:22 60me 16:1 38:22 60me 16:1 38:21 6	, ,				12:15 13:6,7
cases 8:6,14,19 come 16:1 38:22 8:22 corresponding data 13:11 32:10 10:2,8,16,19 47:3 considered 33:7 43:25 32:12 33:9,10 14:14 16:16,24 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 date 1:15 17:7		1	·		13:19
10:2,8,16,19 47:3 considered 33:7 43:25 32:12 33:9,10 14:14 16:16,24 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 18:8 19:3,18 58:11 12:14 13:6 date 1:15 17:7					data 13:11 32:10
14:14 16:16,24 coming 46:17 44:12,18 45:2 counsel 2:6,10 33:12 date 1:15 17:7 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 33:12	· · ·		_		32:12 33:9,10
18:8 19:3,18 Commission 58:11 12:14 13:6 date 1:15 17:7					1
10.0 17.5,10 Commission 50.11	,		•		date 1:15 17:7
20.10,25 21.15					
i I I	20.10,23 21.17	00.22 00.20	10115010000017.5	10.22,20 20.17	
		<u> </u>	I	I	<u> </u>

				Page 61
1-4-142.22	25.5	1 4 0 . 4	E 2.1 57.1 1 1	40.10.41.11
dated 43:23	25:5	document 8:4	E 3:1 57:1,1,1	40:19 41:11
56:18	determine 32:16	11:22 13:10	e-mail 2:5,10	42:6,16,24
Davis 19:19	41:14	27:13 29:4,20	3:18 12:19	43:7 44:15
23:18	determined	32:13 33:16,21	49:2	45:11,25 46:2
day 55:15 56:18	33:18,22	33:24 34:16,25	earlier 30:22,25	46:5 47:16,23
days 58:11	developing 33:7	35:4 38:4,12	42:8 49:17,19	48:4,12 51:2
dean 8:20,24	different 15:11	38:20,23,24	early 31:3	52:6,25 53:5,8
decided 33:23	28:18 31:9,10	39:7,11,13,16	earned 35:14	53:14,22
declare 57:18	31:13,25 45:20	39:20,21,22,23	36:16 37:4	employability
defendant 1:9	difficult 8:23	40:19 41:7,14	52:2	24:3
2:10 18:15	DIRECT 3:5 4:5	41:19,19 42:9	earning 37:19	employed 36:21
19:5	disclose 10:20	42:12,20,21	earnings 32:15	37:8
DEFENDANT	14:15	45:1 51:7	34:11,12,13,22	employee 30:24
3:13	disclosed 15:19	52:12,17 53:5	35:8,13,16,19	56:13,14
define 16:20	16:3 17:4	57:18	44:13 45:7	employees 30:21
degree 7:5,8	23:21	documents 3:17	52:7,9,22,23	30:22
Delaware 7:6,8	disclosure 11:13	5:3 12:25 13:4	Economics 7:6,9	employer 29:16
7:9	13:10 15:2,5	13:12 14:3,9	7:10	employment
deliver 20:12	15:18,20,21	21:14,21 28:21	educational 7:4	22:25 23:12,22
Department	17:3	29:1,2,6 34:25	eight 30:4	24:6,19 30:4
28:11 29:11,12	disclosures 9:7	38:6 39:12	either 6:25 7:12	38:25 43:23
DEPONENT	9:23,25 14:3	40:15,20 41:1	7:17 13:25	Ends 38:25
57:4 58:24	discount 34:14	41:5,8,9,12	19:24 24:20	engagement
depos 6:4	discriminated	42:14 44:9	41:17	12:15 13:1
deposed 5:11,24	25:9	46:20,21 47:9	eligibility 38:14	engaging 47:17
17:10 19:4	discrimination	49:8 51:12,14	38:18 41:19	enter 30:2 57:2
20:3,5 46:24	22:25 23:12,23	51:16	42:20 45:2,3	entering 30:23
deposition 1:14	24:6	doing 7:22 8:19	eligible 30:3	enters 37:24
5:7,22 6:10 7:1	discuss 6:15,18	16:11	Elkins 2:7 3:6	entitled 15:9
10:4,13,17	discusses 12:15	Dr 6:15 40:18	4:6,15 6:17	33:11 38:24
12:16 13:17	discussing 13:1	58:6	9:11,18,21	entity 21:3,8,20
16:6,13 17:1	discussions	Drive 2:3 58:3	11:2 13:9	equivalent 39:24
17:16,23 21:14	32:20	DROP 29:19,22	14:19 15:1,15	errata 58:13
22:16 24:20	dismissal 28:11	30:3,9,12,17	15:24 16:8,13	espresso 4:12
40:16 46:17	36:16 51:17,20	30:19,23 31:3	16:15 17:25	ESQ 2:2,7 58:2
47:2,9 48:10	52:9,11,15	31:9,13,15,21	21:11 24:15	essentially 30:24
48:14 54:4	dismissed 4:23	31:23 32:6,7	25:4,12,18	estimate 40:24
56:1,8 58:6,8	27:20 51:24	36:22 37:23,24	26:7 27:7,10	estimated 39:25
58:22	52:1,2	52:21,23	27:19 28:3,9	estimates 3:19
depositions 5:4	Distribution	DROP's 45:8	29:15 31:7,17	51:9,18
5:19 14:15	39:2	due 49:11	31:19 32:3,24	et 25:10
16:19 47:1	District 1:1,1	duly 4:3 55:12	33:3,15 34:2	ethnicity 25:9
Derek 2:3 58:3	11:24,24	duties 8:24	34:10,20 35:2	Everybody
Description 3:14	DIVISION 1:2		36:2,8,14	45:20
details 21:5 22:6	doctor 20:12	E	37:11,16 40:10	EXAMINATI
	1	ı	1	ı

				Page 62
3:5,7 4:5	9:6,12 11:13	41:4 42:2,7	further 8:23	growth 32:15,17
examined 4:3	26:11,19,25	44:5,8,21 45:6	53:1 56:12	34:12,15,22
example 31:13	35:25	45:15,22 52:20	future 34:15	guarantee 37:8
31:23	far 46:19	55:6,22 56:3	36:17 44:13,16	Guasto 1:5 4:17
	faster 17:22	56:23 58:4,12	44:21 51:23	27:13 36:20
excluding 22:21 excuse 10:1	favor 22:7	focus 32:21	52:22	57:3 58:6
13:17			32.22	
- '	February 17:6,7	follow 6:5 15:7	G	guess 5:15
exempt 6:19 13:12	17:10,11 federal 9:6,22	followed 15:7	game 28:4	guys 15:4,25
_	·	following 33:6 follows 4:4	gender 25:9	H
exhibit 3:14 8:1	11:7,19,25		getting 45:8	H 57:1
8:2 25:22,23	14:8,23 18:24	followup 15:3	give 6:24 9:1	H-E-N-R-I-C
26:1,2 29:7	18:25 19:1,15	forceps 20:12	13:16 17:17,18	18:22
38:2,3 46:12	19:16 26:9	foregoing 57:18	19:10 22:15	half 7:8 48:20
48:25 49:1	40:12 58:11,25	forget 22:8,14	30:24 35:21	hand 55:15
50:14 51:5,6	fee 12:3	forgot 30:10	given 28:5 33:19	handbook 43:21
52:13,18 53:6	file 6:11 9:25	form 21:10	47:24	44:1
exhibits 3:12	26:4	44:11 53:14	go 4:13 5:18,23	
53:19	filed 5:1	forming 28:4	14:13 16:21	happened 20:4 45:14
expedite 53:20	filings 5:4,8	51:15	27:2	harmed 20:12
expert 5:16 7:12	fill 46:15	formula 45:19		head 21:12 36:3
7:17 8:7,12,15	financially 31:2	45:20	goes 16:22	
8:17,22 9:23	56:16	formulating 5:8	going 5:22 6:14 7:25 12:9	hear 4:9,14
10:3,16,24	find 19:10 21:18	7:1 27:22 36:6		25:11
11:7,13 16:8	42:25 46:21	Fort 2:9	14:17 21:10	heard 24:22
16:25 18:6,18	fine 31:19 34:2	forward 36:20	24:12,22 26:13	36:3
19:4 21:2	35:7 43:11	45:4,8 48:10	32:20,22 36:19	held 30:6
22:24 25:15	47:16 50:24	52:3	38:2,10 39:12	help 32:16
26:5,20 44:12	finished 7:7 46:3	forwarded	39:15 40:18	helped 44:11
47:3	first 4:3 6:21 7:6	58:13,14	41:18 43:21	НН 55:22 56:23
Expires 55:23	14:13 16:20	four 8:8 10:2,6	44:1 45:4,8	highlighted
56:24	38:13 42:13,19	14:20,23,24	46:10,23 47:5	29:19
explicitly 14:18	53:18	15:9 16:24	47:14,22 48:10	hired 18:18
extent 34:11	fits 41:8	22:19,23 23:1	48:24 52:2	history 19:8
extra 18:8	five 8:8,12 9:15	23:5,7,11,22	53:18,20,24	hold 6:17 12:8
	46:2 51:7	24:8,9 49:7	good 4:7,8 48:21	17:25 32:25
<u>F</u>	Florida 1:1,8,8	fourth 16:5	gotten 50:4 52:3	40:13 51:18
fact 33:6	1:25 2:4,9 8:17	free 26:18 39:16	government	53:24
facts 6:25 13:1	11:24 19:25	Friday 12:2	21:20	holding 12:10
13:11 33:19	25:1,8,16	fringe 44:16,21	governmental	hour 46:8 48:20
57:18	29:18,22,23,25	front 16:22 23:6	21:3,7	hourly 34:12
fair 12:24 28:4,9	30:2,19 31:12	35:25 36:6	granted 15:6	46:6 49:10
31:3 32:5,5	31:12,21,22,24	FRS 3:17 38:13	great 6:1	hours 48:16 49:7
36:19 39:19	31:25 32:6	39:12 41:18	gross 32:16	Human 41:21
Fall 8:18	37:23 38:13,17	42:20 45:2	grounds 13:5	hypothetical
familiar 4:18,20	38:23,25 39:1	full 18:17 40:6	Group 2:3 58:3	31:18
	-	-	•	-

Hypothetically	15:21 26:12,20	17:6	left-hand 41:3	39:21 40:15
31:17	Initially 27:5	Jessica 1:5 4:17	legal 9:9,13	48:1
	injury 23:8,8,9	4:17 27:13	24:13	looks 23:7 32:14
I	instruct 26:14	Johnson 8:21	let's 9:18 12:8	38:16,20 39:6
idea 29:2	28:1 32:20,23	Judge 16:1	14:13 16:20	39:8 41:16,20
identification	instructed 16:12	judge's 26:11,20	17:7 23:3	42:9 43:21,24
8:2 25:23 38:3	29:1,5	47:18	25:20 31:14	loss 37:18
49:1 51:6	instructing 16:9	July 39:2 43:23	39:11 46:2	lost 37:19
identified 34:11	instructs 40:20	June 18:10	48:2,3 50:5	lot 4:22 5:17
identify 51:16	intended 12:9	55:23 56:24	letter 11:23 12:1	24:10
impacted 24:3	intentionally		12:2,5,11,13	lower 41:2
important 5:25	43:3,9	K	12:16,22 13:15	
impugn 7:23	interest 30:7	keep 19:5,6	13:18,19,21,24	M
impugning 43:7	32:14	Key 2:3 58:3	49:4,5 58:7,11	M 1:14 3:4 4:2
inability 36:22	interested 56:16	kind 23:25	letting 15:13	55:11 56:9
inappropriate	interpret 9:11	knew 46:17	liability 39:24	57:4,21 58:2,6
40:16	interrogatories	know 4:22,23	40:24	making 4:12
include 49:17	15:3	5:15 13:7 15:9	life 35:14	malpractice
50:17	interrogatory	15:13 19:17,23	limited 52:13	17:10,16 18:2
included 52:9	14:18,20,25	20:1,21 24:18	list 3:15 8:3,6	23:9,19
includes 49:25	15:13,16	24:23 25:1,5	9:3 10:1,5,12	manner 48:3
including 48:10	interrupt 6:14	25:19 26:4	10:16 14:13,15	March 20:17
49:8	investment	27:16,20 30:9	16:17,22,23	mark 8:1 25:21
inclusion 58:14	38:24 39:1	30:10 31:20	17:22,23 18:1	38:2 48:24
income 30:5	43:22	32:4 40:14	20:18,19,21,23	marked 8:2
39:24 40:12	involve 21:20	47:5,10,11	23:6,16 26:1	25:23 29:6
51:17,19,22	23:11 30:12	50:8	listed 8:8 10:8	38:3 46:11
incomplete	involved 13:7	knowledge	23:15	49:1 51:6
31:18 45:1	21:8 24:16,16	28:15	Listen 47:1	marking 51:4
increase 30:5	25:15 36:17	known 4:17 41:2	lists 8:6	Mason 1:14 3:4
independently	involving 21:2	knows 24:15	little 4:11 7:25	4:2,7 6:15
26:22 33:23	21:24 22:2,5		34:8	40:18 55:11
INDEX 3:12	22:20,25 25:16	L	lived 8:16	56:9 57:4,21
indicated 14:7	31:21 36:11	larger 39:7	location 19:9	58:2,6
28:18 32:17	irrespective 9:24	lasts 48:16	logically 50:16	Master's 7:8
inflation 32:15	issue 24:1 51:2	late 17:5	long 6:21 39:15	materials 33:7
information	issues 36:5	Lauderdale 2:9	39:19	Math 7:5
11:5 15:18	items 10:11	law 2:3,8 7:12	look 19:9 21:14	matter 14:19
18:16 19:1,2	IX 18:11,24	7:18 9:24 24:1	29:5 39:14,15	mean 33:4,22
19:11 22:15	23:17 24:5	24:2 58:3	40:20 46:20,21	34:7 35:21
40:3 42:17		lawsuit 4:16,18	47:8	37:2 51:18
44:4,10 47:3	J	4:21,24 5:2	looked 6:11	med/mal 20:14
53:7	Jacksonville	11:7	39:23 40:22	23:15
initial 13:18	8:16	lawyer 13:11	looking 21:21	medical 17:9,16
14:3 15:5,17	January 12:2	leave 26:24	29:1,4,6 39:19	18:1 23:9,19
		left 53:17		
	I	I	I	I

				Page 64
Mallying @1-1	20,22,20,0,10	OATH 55.1	20.20.20.11.17	nogo 2.14 20.16
Melkins@mlel	28:22 29:8,10	OATH 55:1	38:20 39:11,17	page 3:14 38:16
2:10 Marsham 28:24	29:13,16 31:23	object 14:17	39:20,22 40:1	39:6,7,8,8
Members 38:24	MyFRS.com 42:13 44:4	15:8 21:10	40:22 41:16	40:11,22 41:3
Miami 1:2,8 2:4	42:13 44:4	32:22 47:14	43:3,13,21	41:20,24 42:7
4:16 27:17		Objection 5:20	44:8,18,24,25	42:12,13,18,19
28:20 29:11,12	$\overline{\mathbf{N}}$ 3:1	9:9 11:1 13:5	45:22 46:10	42:22 43:1,4
57:3 58:4,6	name 4:15 17:19	20:8 22:18	48:9,17,23	43:10,25,25
Miami-Dade	18:11,12,15,17	24:12 25:3,7	49:16,19,24	49:4 53:8,8,8
28:11 29:17	27:7 57:4	25:17 26:6,13	50:6,13,16,19	PAGE/LINE
41:21	names 30:15	27:18,23 28:1	50:21 51:12,14	57:6
Michael 2:7 4:15		29:14 30:13	52:17,20,25	pages 40:23,23
17:21 32:22	nature 33:19	31:5,16 32:2	53:17	42:9,22 51:7
47:14	nearly 51:23	32:19 34:1,9	old 35:12	paid 41:16 46:19
middle 39:12	necessary 57:17	34:19 35:1,23	omit 42:25	46:22 47:12,19
41:4 42:1	need 6:4 21:15	36:1,7,13,23	omitted 42:22	49:14,20,22
Mike 14:17	53:21,23	37:10,15 40:9	43:8	50:2,7
mini 53:20	needs 15:8	41:10 42:5,15	once 15:6 22:7	papers 5:1
minute 9:1	negotiations	42:23 43:5	58:13	paralegal 49:3
25:20 32:24,24	43:22	44:14 45:10,18	one-year 10:20	part 5:18 8:22
33:24 46:10	never 4:25 11:22	45:24 48:11	ones 20:21	15:19 23:21
minutes 6:22	12:7 27:24	52:5	online 40:1	28:4 35:13
mischaracteri	46:18	obtain 53:7	opinion 5:8 7:1	38:6 44:12,18
43:6	nine 32:9 33:9	Obviously 5:21	27:22 28:4	52:7
missed 11:18,25	Nineties 8:18	office 2:5,9 4:12	44:12,19 51:15	particular 31:14
missing 10:9,19	nitty-gritty 5:23	49:3 58:8	opinions 33:7	parties 56:13
14:14 16:16	noise 4:12	official 55:15	optional 30:3	58:14
18:9 20:16,20	normally 5:23	oh 33:24	Options 39:2	parties' 56:14
20:24	Northeast 2:8	okay 4:9 5:11	order 26:11,20	party 58:13
misunderstood	Notary 1:25	6:9 7:3,3,16,21	38:12 41:13,17	Paul 1:14 3:4 4:2
50:20	55:21 56:23	8:11 10:8,11	53:20,25	12:14 55:11
mitigation 36:11	note 14:7 21:17	10:19 11:20	ordering 53:19	56:9 57:4,21
36:18	28:17	12:8,13,21,25	58:13,14	58:2,6
mixed 42:1	notes 56:11	14:9,13 16:20	ordinarily 9:15	pay 35:25 36:6
MLE 2:8	Notice 39:2	17:9 19:18,21	original 11:23	41:12
morning 4:7,8	noting 11:18	20:10,16 21:1	12:1,4 15:20	pays 30:7
6:12	number 17:17	21:24 22:2,10	58:13	penalties 57:18
motion 4:11	17:18 19:12,13	22:23 23:14,20	originally 12:9	pending 11:21
15:6	19:15,21 32:9	24:5 25:1,6,20	outside 31:21,24	pension 21:25
motivate 30:21	33:9 41:5	25:20 26:15	overlaps 38:11	22:3,12,21
MR' 31:17	42:20 43:23	27:2,4 28:9,14	override 14:20	31:1 35:14
municipalities	52:22	28:22 29:18,25	oversight 43:13	37:21 45:7,9
22:5,12	numbers 34:21	30:11,15 31:22	Overview 40:11	45:15,19,23
municipality 1:8	37:18,22	32:5,9 33:15	owed 50:23	52:4,10
21:2,8,20	0	35:7 36:5,10		people 6:2 25:8
22:20 28:18,19		36:19 38:1,16	<u> </u>	Perfect 4:15 7:3
	O-301 2:4 58:4			
	=	=	-	-

1				Page 65
22.0.20.1	4.51.17.10	24.24.27.10	42.25	27.10.50.11
32:9 38:1	post 51:17,19	34:24 37:18	42:25	37:19 58:11
52:25	52:8,15	42:13 43:10	purposely 43:3,8	recall 11:4 12:18
performed	potential 34:13	produced 12:5	put 21:15 33:5	12:19 20:2
17:23	44:13	12:17,22 13:2	53:18	21:4,12,19,23
period 10:12,15	predicated	13:24 14:11	Q	36:4
perjury 57:18	34:15	15:2,4 26:9		receipt 58:11
person 18:19	predismissal	35:4 38:6,13	qualified 7:11	receive 30:7
personal 23:8,8	52:7,8	41:4,9 42:21	7:17 8:7,12,15	50:11 51:22
23:9	prepare 6:9 47:2	43:14,16,19,25	18:6 19:4	received 9:16
PhD 1:14 3:4 4:2	prepared 47:8	53:9	question 12:21	11:22 12:2
7:10 55:11	presently 8:20	producing 27:15	15:9 21:17	50:10,13 58:13
56:9 57:4,21	presume 11:10	production 40:7	23:4 26:16,19	recognize 26:8
58:2	11:12 26:25	42:1	28:8 32:21,23	record 9:20
phone 6:15,21	28:14	Professional	33:1 35:3	18:17 21:17
6:23	presumes 36:20	1:24 56:6	45:12 46:23	28:25 46:4
physically 50:10	37:13	58:18	47:7,18 48:5	47:17 56:11
50:13	pretermination	program 29:19	50:20 53:2	referenced 33:8
place 1:17 35:16	34:13 37:1,2,4	29:22 30:18,19	questioning 48:3	referencing
plaintiff 1:6 2:6	pretty 22:4,11	30:23 31:4,13	questions 16:9	50:14
18:13	46:25	31:15,23 32:6	21:15,16 38:21	referring 12:1
plaintiff's 12:14	previous 9:3	32:7 37:23	53:1	29:22 35:5
17:19 18:11	10:2 16:24	programs 30:12	quickly 4:13	refers 44:16
43:24	36:24 49:9,23	31:9		reflect 28:25
plan 22:21 30:3	53:5	project 36:17	$\frac{R}{R}$	34:3
38:24 39:1	previously 19:3	projected 52:8,8	R 57:1,1	regard 58:12
43:22 51:22	29:5	pronouncing	R-U-L-L-O	regarding 9:7
plans 21:25 22:3	prior 8:13 10:20	27:7	18:14	reiterate 27:14
22:12	12:14 13:6	properly 16:3	race 25:9	relate 42:8
please 7:4 9:1	15:21,25 21:25	provide 9:3 11:4	rate 34:14 41:14	related 5:3 36:5
16:16 18:13	24:9	14:24 16:5,16	46:6 49:10	37:18 42:2
23:4 32:21	privilege 6:19	16:18,23	rates 32:15,15	relating 13:12
33:2 45:12	13:6,13 32:22	provided 9:17	32:15,17 34:12	14:3,9 33:10
58:8	33:10	10:5 12:4 13:2	34:15,22	44:5
PLLC 2:3 58:3	privileged 33:4	13:8,11 15:14	re-ask 26:19	relative 5:15,16
plugged 40:1,2	33:13	27:24 29:6	read 4:24 5:1,6,7	56:12,14
plus 35:20	probably 5:12	51:13	27:21 28:6	relied 33:6
point 22:13	5:16,17	providing 19:2	43:10 54:1,3	remained 36:21
47:12,19 49:20	problem 7:24	27:12	57:18 58:9	37:8
50:8	15:16,17 16:5	public 1:25	reading 58:21	remember 8:5
pointless 16:14	Procedure 9:7	21:24 22:2,12	really 19:16 32:4	14:15 16:18
Police 28:11	9:22 58:25	22:21 53:7,10	33:20,24 34:6	21:6 22:2,5
29:11,12	proceeding 7:13	53:12 55:21	realm 24:4	23:18 30:15
portion 38:12	7:13	56:23	reason 37:13,17	50:8 53:10
49:11	produce 13:18	purported 20:11	40:22 43:8	remind 5:24
possible 32:21	14:2 21:22	purpose 42:22	50:22 57:6	remote 1:17 56:8
		1 1 1 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	reasonable	
	l	l	I	l

				Page 66
	l	l	1	l
remotely 4:3	Resources 41:21	9:7,12,22	second 9:18 12:8	41:21 44:5
55:11	response 15:16	10:23 11:4	17:25 38:1	53:10,13
repeat 33:1	responses 15:23	13:13 14:2,19	46:9 49:4	sites 53:7
report 3:16 10:1	responsibility	14:20,21,23	sector 21:25	sitting 12:16,21
13:18 14:22	37:17	15:1,5,6,7,9,10	22:3,12,21	21:6,19 22:10
15:3 16:2 17:4	rest 20:21	15:10,18 16:23	see 5:18 8:3 18:1	22:15 29:7
17:5 18:16	result 24:2 28:10	17:1 19:9	18:1 23:3	40:14
19:1 25:21,21	49:9 52:15	46:25 58:25	25:24 28:12	smaller 52:9
26:1,2,5,12,21	retained 11:6	rules 5:22,23	29:19,20 32:9	Smartasset.com
26:25 27:5,12	30:12	58:11	38:4,7,17 39:4	40:8 41:2 42:2
27:15 28:15,17	retainer 12:3,4	Rullo 18:11	39:9 41:5,24	Smith 2:3 58:3
29:7,18 33:5	50:11	23:24	46:13 48:22	somebody 46:24
33:19,23 34:3	retire 30:8,22	run 17:7 22:8	49:12 51:7,10	sorry 17:14 23:1
34:18,21 35:7	retirement	running 35:19	52:12,17	25:12 36:25
36:6,11,19	29:23 30:1,2,6	runs 41:5	seeing 10:23	45:12 46:9
37:13 46:11,11	30:20 31:12,24		seeked 15:22	50:20 51:19
46:13,15 49:10	32:1,6 37:21	S	seen 30:10	sort 43:22
50:12 52:1	37:23 38:14,14	S 57:1	send 12:6,18	sounds 12:10
56:8	38:18,18,23,25	Salabarria 4:17	sending 12:19	sources 32:10,12
REPORTED	39:1 41:4,18	5:3 27:13	sense 36:15	33:9,11,13
1:24	42:3,8,20 44:5	28:23 29:8	sent 12:7 46:18	Southern 1:1
reporter 6:1	44:8,17,22	35:11 36:20	serious 16:10	11:24
53:21,23 54:1	45:2,3,6,15,22	39:25 49:6	services 46:20	Special 39:2
56:7	51:10,17,19,21	Salabarria's	47:13,20	specific 19:6
REPORTER'S	51:22 52:15,20	27:16 40:24	set 40:23 42:13	specifically
56:1	retiring 30:25	44:13 45:3,23	share 46:10	15:14 21:7
reports 35:8	31:3	51:17	short 12:9	speculation 20:9
50:25	reveal 33:4	salary 34:13	Shorthand 56:6	24:13
represent 4:16	review 49:8 56:9	saw 4:25	show 7:25 38:10	spelling 18:12
18:19,20	58:9,10	saying 7:24 41:9	showed 52:12	spend 27:3
represents 33:6	revise 49:8	says 14:19 15:10	53:5,8	spend 27.3 spent 49:6,7
request 9:15,16	right 4:7 5:21	16:23 17:1,3	showing 38:2	spreadsheet
27:6,11	9:22 11:8	17:22 23:8	48:24 51:4	27:12 49:9
requested 9:5	12:11,22 16:10	32:10 33:6,9	side 57:17	stamped 38:7
11:3,4 14:1,25	16:14 21:1	38:21 40:11	sign 58:9,9	stands 30:9
15:14 56:10	25:1 26:24	41:20 46:12	significant 31:1	47:19
required 9:25	35:17,22 37:7	49:5	31:2	stapled 39:17
14:2,21 15:2	37:21 38:1	scanned 12:6	signing 58:22	state 1:25 25:8
16:18 26:4	41:17,21 43:14	41:12,13	signing 38.22 sir 8:4 9:14,22	30:21 31:14,15
42:18	45:16,20 51:3	school 8:21 24:1	16:16 21:9,11	31:21,22 55:6
requirement 9:6	51:4 52:1,14	schools 24:2	21:13,13 28:23	55:22 56:3,23
11:13	53:16	screen 25:24	28:23,24 29:4	stated 57:18
requires 10:1	Rights 25:2,16	46:10	33:15 46:20	stated 37:18 statement 31:3
-		scroll 38:10	47:7	47:24
14:23 research 19:8	Rodriguez 49:3	seal 55:15		
1 escarcii 19:8	rule 5:25 6:5,18		site 40:2,8 41:2	statements
			l	

				Tage 07
28:14 51:10		50:24	47:5 49:16	30:17 31:8
STATES 1:1		things 13:12	tool 40:2	Understood
stating 11:23	T 57:1,1	22:6 27:2	top 21:12 36:3	27:21
Statute 58:12	take 6:2 9:18	32:16 46:6	38:17	unethical 47:17
statute 38.12 stay 40:19	35:21 36:18	53:18	total 49:10	UNITED 1:1
	46:2	think 11:20	touch 53:25	
Stenographer 1:24 58:18	taken 58:8			university 7:6,9 7:10 8:21
	talk 6:5 25:20	16:12 17:6,6	track 19:5,6	
stenographic	26:14 29:18	23:16 28:7	transcribed 58:8	unnecessary
56:11	32:20	34:17 37:22	transcript 56:9	43:12
stenographica	talked 23:20	43:9 45:14	56:10 57:2	unpack 12:10
56:8	24:6 26:17	49:19 51:2	58:7,9,10,13	updated 3:16
stop 26:24 35:15	33:12	52:14	58:14,22	25:21 26:2,5
35:16 40:15	talking 6:2	third 40:17	transcripts 5:7	46:11
Strike 15:6	26:16	thousand 5:19	transpired 4:22	use 6:25 8:24
striking 26:11	talks 38:13	7:15 46:24	trial 10:3,17	33:20,24 34:6
26:20	tax 39:2,24	thousands 10:24	14:16 16:25	34:7,17 36:17
student 24:1	40:12,24 41:14	three 8:8,10,11	17:22 24:20	45:6 51:16
stuff 15:3	taxes 38:22	9:4,16 10:5,7	trials 16:6,18	57:17
style 17:13,15	tell 6:14 7:3	14:18,22,25	tribunal 7:14,18	useful 43:1
submit 43:2,4	14:14 19:16	23:14 42:9	17:18 18:23	
submitted 33:18	33:11 47:10	48:18	19:23	V
33:22 46:16	telling 12:13	three-page	tried 12:6	V-A-H-L-E
subsequent	19:5 22:11	42:21 45:1	true 56:10 57:19	17:20 18:3
13:16 28:17	33:16 44:10	three-year 10:12	truly 58:16	Vahle 17:20
suggested 58:10	Tennessee's	10:15	try 21:14	various 32:10,12
suggesting 15:15	31:15	time 1:16 6:3	trying 7:23	33:9,10,12
Suite 2:4 58:4	term 36:3	8:25 9:25	44:24	34:24
supposed 15:19	terminated 37:5	14:21 15:2	two 6:2 7:7 8:8	vested 51:21
47:1,2,25	37:12	27:3 30:21	14:22 34:21	52:10,16
sure 6:3,5 7:16	termination	40:17 49:6,8	40:23 43:16	VII 24:11,14,17
16:7 19:2 21:4	36:24	52:10 53:6	48:16 50:25	24:18,23
22:11 24:22	Terrace 2:8	times 5:13 6:4	two-minute 9:19	Villanova 7:7
27:14 48:7	testified 4:4 10:3	7:11,15,17	type 23:8	violated 15:5
Susan 1:24	10:13,16 16:25	8:12 10:24		vs 1:7 57:3 58:6
55:21 56:6,22	18:4 24:20	46:24 47:4	U	***
58:18	47:4 49:19	Title 18:11,24	U.S 11:24	W
sworn 4:3 55:12	testify 17:25	23:17 24:5,11	unclear 41:7	W2's 28:18
system 29:23	20:3	24:14,16,18,23	undersigned	wait 32:24,24
30:1,2 31:12	testimony 8:11	today 12:16,22	55:10	33:24 53:17
31:24 32:1,6	14:16 43:6	21:6,19 22:10	understand 5:21	waive 54:2 58:9
37:23 38:14,18	Texas 7:10	22:16 29:7	6:7 11:6 19:15	58:21
38:24,25 39:1	Thank 6:16 21:1	40:14 48:15	27:15 33:14	Waiver 58:20
41:5 42:3,8	27:10 40:21	today's 48:10	44:9,9 48:2	wan 19:8
44:6,8,22 45:7	53:16	told 6:3 10:24	understanding	want 7:16 16:8
45:15,22 52:20	thing 13:15 43:8	34:17 46:25	17:24 29:25	17:17 21:16,22
,== 0=:=0	thing 15.15 45.6			27:2,3,14
	I	I	I	l

				Page 68
28:25 33:4 43:10 47:17	$\frac{\mathbf{X}}{\mathbf{X}3:1}$	10:13 1:16 100 8:19	57:4 58:1 2027 55:23	53 3:7 56 35:16 36:21
53:25		11:36 1:16 54:4	56:24	37:9,14
wanted 28:3	Y	1212 2:8	2047 35:15	
40:14	Yeah 7:19 9:15	14 41:9	2073 35:8	6
wanting 16:5	11:18 18:10	15 6:22 30:14	23 58:1	7
wants 5:18	19:19 20:17	40:23 41:3	23rd 43:23	
wasn't 14:1	23:19 24:10	16 39:8 42:12	55:15 56:18	786-688-2335
15:20 16:3	32:19 33:3	43:25 55:23	25 3:16	2:5
28:20 33:3	41:12 45:13	56:24	26 6:18 9:7 11:4	8
43:11,14,16,16	year 7:7 8:19	16th 2:8	13:13 14:2	83:15
watch 16:2	10:9 16:6,17	17-CA-001347	26-A 9:23	80 8:19
wavering 24:4	16:20 18:8	17:19		800 48:16 50:11
way 23:6 30:20	32:14 40:24	19 1:15 57:4	3	81 35:11
31:13 35:8	41:15	1985 7:22 8:18	3 3:17 38:2	82 35:11
36:21 37:9,13	years 7:7 8:10	19th 12:3	41:20,24 42:13	02 33.11
web 40:2,7 41:2	8:12,13,17,18		42:19,22 43:4	9
41:21 44:5	9:4,15 10:2,6,6	2	43:10 53:8	954-401-2608
53:7,10,12	14:18 15:10	2 3:16 25:22	30 35:21 42:21	2:9
week 53:22	16:24 22:19,23	26:2 29:7 41:3	58:11	954)523-5326
went 32:7	23:1,5,22 24:8	41:24 42:18,22	30(e)Florida	58:8
withdraw 35:2	24:9 30:4	46:12 53:8	58:25	995 8:9,14
witness 3:3 8:17	32:14 35:12,20	2,000 48:13	31 8:17 41:5	
8:22 9:23 10:3	36:16	2,100 48:6 49:16	32 41:6	
16:25 21:18	yesterday 6:11	49:20,24 50:9	33 35:22 41:6	
26:15 28:25	6:13	50:10,17,23	43:24	
47:4,15,16,21	Yup 9:2 28:13	2:17-CV-0138	33131-2433 2:4	
47:23,25 54:1		19:14	58:4	
54:3 55:15	Z	20 35:20	33304-2323 2:9	
witnesses 5:17	0	2000's 8:19	36 35:22	
woman 23:25		2013-CA-0076	38 3:17	
words 9:24	000032 41:8	19:22	4	
work 8:22 13:16	03-26-2024 3:18	2016 16:22	4 3:5,18 48:25	
35:15	1	2020 16:21,21	50:14	
worked 18:20	13:15 8:1 26:1	17:11,19 18:10	400 46:8 49:10	
22:7,11,20,24	40:23 41:20	19:20 23:17	408027 55:22	
28:23 29:8	42:22 53:8	34:22	56:23	
workers 34:12	1,000 5:12 7:20	2021 20:17	48 3:18	
write 49:9 57:2	1,300 50:12	34:22		
writing 50:12	1,600 49:11,14	2022 18:3	5	
written 17:4	49:17,25 50:3	2023 17:5 39:3 39:25 40:25	5 3:19 51:5	
27:12	50:14,17	41:15	52:13,18	
wrong 31:10	1:22-CV-2100	2024 1:15 17:6,7	500 5:12 7:19	
50:16	1:3 57:3	55:16 56:18	51 3:19	
	10 30:14	33.10 30.10	520 2:3 58:3	